

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 20982

**Title:** Renal failure in cirrhosis: Emerging concepts

**Reviewer's code:** 00034635

**Reviewer's country:** Spain

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2015-06-29 22:59

**Date reviewed:** 2015-07-04 18:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Lisboa Bittencourt et al conducted a review on acute kidney injury (AKI) in cirrhosis. This is a pertinent, updated and well structured review on the current knowledge and consensus on diagnosis, prognosis scoring and management of AKI-associated cirrhosis. I suggest the following modifications of the manuscript: 1. In order to facilitate reading, the old and new ICA criteria on HRS should be placed in one table (Please, unify tables 1 and 2). 2. On page 4, 1st line of the 4th paragraph: "...3 stages of AKIN are shown in Table-2". Table 5 should replace Table 2. 3. In table-6: ICA-AKI criteria, a column on the right hand side, containing the in-hospital and 90-days mortality rate for each stage should be added. 4. More data on efficacy/ effectiveness of midodrine plus octreotide or albumin in HRS-1 treatment would be wellcome.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 20982

**Title:** Renal failure in cirrhosis: Emerging concepts

**Reviewer's code:** 00068215

**Reviewer's country:** Romania

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2015-06-29 22:59

**Date reviewed:** 2015-07-10 03:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper of Bittencourt et al highlights the current literature about the concept of acute kidney injury and its application in cirrhosis. The authors also differentiated between the various causes of AKI especially of Hepatorenal syndrome, a special form of pre-renal azotemia that accounts for 25% of pre-renal AKI in cirrhosis. This paper is well organized and written and of interest to WJG readers. The topic itself is interesting as well as for gastroenterologists and nephrologists. I recommend to use only the revised diagnosis of HRS according to the International Ascites Club (Table 2) and to add studies with Midodrine and Octreotide as alternative of Terlipressine for Type 1 HRS

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 20982

**Title:** Renal failure in cirrhosis: Emerging concepts

**Reviewer's code:** 02861000

**Reviewer's country:** Spain

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2015-06-29 22:59

**Date reviewed:** 2015-07-18 16:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript "Renal Failure in Cirrhosis: Emerging Concepts" aims to review the history of acute kidney injury in cirrhosis (AKI) by evaluating the different classifications and also, specifically addresses the management of Hepatorenal Syndrome. The manuscript is very complete and well written. Only a few suggestions to improve its content and utility for the readers of WJG.

- Too many classification tables are displayed. I suggest that only the latest criteria from the International Ascites Club Criteria should be specified.
- When the authors refer to Table 3 in the text, they only mention that diagnosed HRS was lower than expected in patients with AKI and cirrhosis. If this is the only message from the comparison of the studies, I believe the table could be deleted and summarized in the text (page 3)
- In page 4 it is stated "The 3 stages of AKIN are shown in Table 2". It should say Table 5, please correct.
- In page 8 please review the cited references 52-56 as some of them are incorrectly placed.
- More information regarding HRS management and octreotide and midodrine treatment is required.
- In the conclusions, a paragraph regarding optimal management of HRS would be useful.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 20982

**Title:** Renal failure in cirrhosis: Emerging concepts

**Reviewer's code:** 03366770

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2015-06-29 22:59

**Date reviewed:** 2015-07-07 14:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[ Y ] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[ Y ] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a review article where emerging concepts of renal failure in cirrhosis are outlined. Overall this is a well written paper. Please revise the paper for grammatical as well as errors with spaces between words. Please see attached word document for suggested changes. Other issues: 1. The last line of introduction should be a summary of what you are trying to convey in the paper. For eg, in this article we outline and evaluate the definitions for kidney injury in patients with cirrhosis, particularly the emerging ICA-AKI criteria and the advances in the management of renal failure. Please quote the source from which the tables have been borrowed in full: For example: adapted from: Bellomo et al, Crit Care 2004; 8: R204-R212 There is no need to write pubmed ID in the references.