

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 20709

Title: Role of pentoxifylline in non-alcoholic fatty liver disease in high-fat diet- induced obesity in mice

Reviewer's code: 02861012

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-06-17 19:57

Date reviewed: 2015-06-23 19:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors studied the effects of pentoxifylline in an obesity model in order to understand its potential effects in NAFLD. However, there are several points that are unclear and need to be addressed: 1. The authors do not state the actual number of animals used per group. 2. As stated in introduction, NAFLD occurs more often in males and primarily affects the middle aged and the elderly; however here the authors used mice that were 4-week old, why? 3. In the current study mice were treated with HFD for 12 weeks and the last two weeks they received pentoxifylline. In the other studies they describe in discussion and compare their results, pentoxifylline was administered for more than 2 weeks. It is unclear where the authors based their protocol? 4. The effect of pentoxifylline in inflammatory cell infiltrate should have also been studied. 5. Minor comment: Figure 1 labelling is not clear.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 20709

Title: Role of pentoxifylline in non-alcoholic fatty liver disease in high-fat diet- induced obesity in mice

Reviewer's code: 00502973

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-06-17 19:57

Date reviewed: 2015-06-22 20:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the current manuscript, Acedo et al reported that administration of pentoxifylline was able to reduce the fat accumulation in liver of obese mice fed by high-fat diet. This study is helpful to better understand the mechanism of pentoxifylline on NAFLD. English could be improved though it is acceptable at current status. Concerns exist and should be addressed. Major concern: As pentoxifylline is considered as an antioxidant, its effects on oxidative injury may be involved in its effects on fatty liver. Oxidative stress is also involved in the pathogenesis of steatohepatitis. Therefore, the effects of pentoxifylline on oxidative injury should be involved in current study such as on lipid oxidation. Minor concerns: 1. Introduction: The author stated "NAFLD diagnosis requires the exclusion of secondary etiologies, including alcohol consumption, hepatitis C and drug usage". HBV infection should also be excluded before the diagnosis of NAFLD especially in Asia. 2. Necropsy and sample collection: The author stated "Liver and adipose tissue was perfused with 15 mL Phosphate Buffered Saline (PBS), collected and weighed." The author should clarify where the adipose tissue was taken from.