

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 20030

Title: Clinical and biological significance of precursor lesions of intrahepatic cholangiocarcinoma

Reviewer's code: 02453015

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-05-30 15:34

Date reviewed: 2015-06-14 23:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Major concerns: 1. A table comparing different precursor lesions of intrahepatic cholangiocarcinoma is highly recommended. 2. A comprehensive figure showing the progress of these precursor lesions into intrahepatic cholangiocarcinoma is also highly recommended. 3. If the manuscript does not deal with proper treatment of the precursor diseases, then the title might need to be changed into more specific aspects, such as "biological significance and the molecular mechanisms of the precursor lesions of ICC"

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 20030

Title: Clinical and biological significance of precursor lesions of intrahepatic cholangiocarcinoma

Reviewer's code: 02861363

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-05-30 15:34

Date reviewed: 2015-05-31 09:55

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is well written manuscript reviewing pathological considerations for the origin of cholangiocarcinoma as well as molecular characteristics of each lesion related to malignant potential. However, it is difficult to understand each lesion without representative images of pathological features. I recommend to the authors to put the pathological images of at least H&E or, if possible, some molecular staining for each category, which will improve the quality of the manuscript.