

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 19238

Title: Microwave ablation of hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 03014597

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-05-08 13:57

Date reviewed: 2015-06-23 18:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I read with interest this nice technical review about MW technology. Our Group in Padova - Italy (Chirurgia Epatobiliare - Università degli Studi di Padova) have been using MW technology since 2009 with high volume cases experience, especially in the laparoscopic setting and in HCC downstaging & bridge to Liver transplantation. I think you should better focus some clinical points (i'll suggest some papers from our group): 1) You should better explain the role of MW in surgery, especially regarding laparoscopic approach in HCC ablation (PMID: 24750429) 2) Analyze the actual role of MW in HCC downstaging & bridge to liver transplantation (PMID: 21620060) 3) take a look on MW and HCC recurrence after liver transplantation (PMID: 24919730) Otherwise we demonstrated the utility of MW application for liver resection and "two-stage hepatectomy" (PMID: 25605516 and PMID: 24651131).

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 19238

Title: Microwave ablation of hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 02937564

Reviewer's country: India

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-05-08 13:57

Date reviewed: 2015-07-13 16:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Good idea of reviewing the clinical data of MWA. The author is advised to be more specific in relation to the clinical results.