

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21285

Title: Vitamin E reduces liver stiffness in nonalcoholic fatty liver disease

Reviewer's code: 02541391

Reviewer's country: Romania

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-07-06 17:28

Date reviewed: 2015-07-22 04:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

A well written work. Minor language polishing is required

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21285

Title: Vitamin E reduces liver stiffness in nonalcoholic fatty liver disease

Reviewer's code: 02444949

Reviewer's country: South Korea

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-07-06 17:28

Date reviewed: 2015-07-22 10:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Author investigated the effect of vitamin E on nonalcoholic fatty liver disease (NAFLD). They suggested that vitamin E treatment for 1 year reduced stiffness in NAFLD patients and the responses were similar between different PNPLA3 genotypes. The work was logically designed and nicely described. However, this paper has a few minor question and revision. 1. Why did you design 150 mg for 2 patients and 300 mg for 4 patient? 2. The pattern of all results is same. 3. P 13. 4 line from the bottom: markedlyimporved ? markedly improved

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21285

Title: Vitamin E reduces liver stiffness in nonalcoholic fatty liver disease

Reviewer's code: 00503443

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-07-06 17:28

Date reviewed: 2015-08-07 16:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper MS n° 21285 entitled: Vitamin E ..., aims to demonstrate that the use of vitamin E may improve liver stiffness, evaluated by non-invasive methods. The paper is simple but well conceived and written. However, there are some limitations due to, as the same authors state, the limited number of cases, the evaluation of liver stiffness which is done by non-invasive methods and the fact that patients with genotype GG of PNPLA3 are more severe. However, the paper in the opinion of this reviewer may be suitable for publication after an appropriate revision of the questions raised. Abstract section page 3 line 10: there is no need to specify here the machine used and how the result is acquired. This is specified in Materials and Methods. So you may delete from "using a Siemens .. to .. meter/second (m/s)" page 3 line 21: "after baseline" can be deleted because is a repetition page 4 line 4: "also showed significant improved" please correct Materials and Methods section page 6, first line: "Vitamin E was with NAFLD caused by atherosclerosis diabetic". NaflD is not caused by atherosclerosis or diabetic retinopathy, but it is associated with these conditions. Please correct Vitamin E administration page 7: the dose of vitamin E is not clear. It seems that 150, 300 or 600 mg are given 3 times a day. Please specify that the total dose of 150, 300 or 600 mg

600 mg is given into 3 administrations per day. Results section Baseline characteristics: from this paragraph and from table 1 it is evident that patients with genotype GG of PNPLA3 are older and have a more advanced liver disease, which means that in this group it will be harder to obtain a reduction of fibrosis. In fact, the only one parameters which differs between the two groups is the lack of reduction of Fib 4 in GG patients. Effect of Vitamin E on serum AST levels, ... on serum ALT levels and ... on serum Gamma-GTP levels can be putted together, because repetitive Effect of vitamin E on Vs, page 11: the group CG/GG does not exist; it is, perhaps, CC/CG? The same error is at page 21 in "Figure 4". Please verify Discussion section The discussion section is a little prolix; there is often a repetition of results and it is not sufficiently evidenced that the GG group include a number of patients with liver cirrhosis, which may justify why Fib 4 in this group does not reduce. Furthermore the statement that "ARFI is more sensitive the liver biopsies for detecting ..." is too hard, so it needs to be mitigate or avoided.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21285

Title: Vitamin E reduces liver stiffness in nonalcoholic fatty liver disease

Reviewer's code: 02534481

Reviewer's country: Saudi Arabia

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-07-06 17:28

Date reviewed: 2015-07-22 15:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Good work on evaluating the effect of Vit E on NAFLD, questions: 1- The used criteria to establish the diagnosis of NAFLD in these patients is not clear 2- Its not clear what this means "caused by atherosclerosis, diabetic retinopathy, or prevention of lipid peroxidation" 3- Should add the IRB number for approval 4- Not clear on what basis the Vit E dose was selected 5- Why this sample size was chosen and on what based outcome 6- would the authors think the negative results are due to small size of biased effect 7- How can this add to the published trial