

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21076

Title: Treating morbid obesity in cirrhosis: A quest of holy grail

Reviewer's code: 02941980

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-07-05 19:48

Date reviewed: 2015-07-05 23:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review "Treating morbid obesity in cirrhosis: quest of Holy Grail" shows that the problem of obesity is increasing worldwide in epidemic proportions, and the treatment of obesity is difficult in cirrhosis due to difficulty in implementation of lifestyle measures, limited data on safety of anti-obesity drugs and high risk of surgery. Subsequently, they discuss the various weight reductions strategies in brief and their applicability in patients with cirrhosis. Overall, the paper is well written and sound, and give people an overview of all the treatment of obese liver cirrhosis patients and their current state. But there are still some problems need to be explained and revised. Minor: 1. All acronyms should be defined at their first appearance in the manuscript. Such as "non-alcoholic steatohepatitis (NASH)" in the introduction and "liver cirrhosis (LC) patients" in the text. 2. Some subtitle should be uniformly written in uppercase.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21076

Title: Treating morbid obesity in cirrhosis: A quest of holy grail

Reviewer's code: 02942666

Reviewer's country: Pakistan

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-07-05 19:48

Date reviewed: 2015-07-19 20:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Treating morbid obesity in cirrhosis: quest of Holy Grail Reviewer comments: General comments: This review has highlighted the importance of obesity in cirrhotic patients as how does it affect the mortality. Authors have critically reviewed the subject. The quality of the manuscript and readability needs further improvement. Specific comments: Title: Reflects accurately the content of the study. Introduction: 1. Further elaborate the rationale of treating obesity in patients with advance liver disease. 2. Briefly describe possible mechanism which linked obesity and cirrhosis like various cytokines. It will take the article to another level. 3. Authors only discuss the association of obesity in terms of NASH with cirrhosis. Although NASH is the commonest association but other causes like viral related should be discussed with reference to obesity. 4. Authors discussed all the drugs used in obesity and their role in cirrhotic patients. To improve the article it should also include poly therapies used to treat obese cirrhotics.