

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13987

Title: Progress and prospects of engineered-sequence specific DNA modulating technologies for the management of liver diseases

Reviewer's code: 02445111

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-09-13 09:18

Date reviewed: 2014-09-18 03:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript "Progress and prospects of engineered-sequence specific DNA modulating technologies for the management of liver diseases" by Nicholson et al. describes a very interesting and fairly comprehensive review of introducing foreign nucleic acids into cells to correct inborn genomic errors that cause disease or to protect against the introduction of foreign DNA, like by viruses. This review article covers a good deal for the state of technology that we presently know about the effectiveness of several potential methodologies that could be used in clinical situations to specifically target genomic targeting approaches to correct various disease states, although this technology is not in routine clinical practice, primarily due to the low productivity of targeted gene disruption. Overall, this is an excellent article; however, this article could be improved if the authors would have addressed specific targeting of foreign nucleic acids to specific organs and cell types. In addition, the authors should have discussed the potential influence of the development of immune reactions to the various delivery methods. A final concern is that in many of the cell culture studies, the efficiency of gene reduction is not that impressive, about 50% or so, which might prove very problematic for this introduction of these procedures in clinical practice. Would multiple treatments be necessary to rid the cells of the harmful nucleic acids? Overall, this is a very good review article. A few concerns are present that should have been addressed by the author's a



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

discussion of potential immune reactions to the various gene delivery methods would have been useful. Also, when introducing sequence-specific gene editing segments, would these result in “off target” effects? Overall, this is a very good review article.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13987

Title: Progress and prospects of engineered-sequence specific DNA modulating technologies for the management of liver diseases

Reviewer's code: 02860585

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-09-13 09:18

Date reviewed: 2014-09-14 22:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the present paper, authors aimed to review the role of engineered-sequence specific DNA modulating technologies for the management of liver diseases. Many liver diseases ultimately need liver transplantation, but is available to only a tiny fraction of patients with end-stage liver diseases. In this scenario, DNA modulating technologies could help. Therefore, the review is justified and is clinically relevant. The design of the review is optimal and the illustrations are very explicative. Taken all together, it is a very good paper, just I think the last section should be shortened and focused on conclusions.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13987

Title: Progress and prospects of engineered-sequence specific DNA modulating technologies for the management of liver diseases

Reviewer's code: 02944884

Reviewer's country: 0

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-09-13 09:18

Date reviewed: 2014-10-04 17:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting paper which may improve our knowledge in the fields. The subject matter is suitable for the intended audience and it fits the journal scope. Article is mostly clearly written, but Title is suggestive of the article's content. Article is appropriately organized and the headings are indicative of content I suggest to accept this paper in the present form.