

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 16378

**Title:** Mean platelet volume as a novel predictor of systematic inflammatory response in cirrhotic patients with culture-negative neutrocytic ascites

**Reviewer's code:** 00053417

**Reviewer's country:** China

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2015-01-16 16:14

**Date reviewed:** 2015-01-17 13:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Early diagnosis of cirrhotic patients with culture negative neutrocytic ascites (CNNA) is important in clinical practice. Mean platelet volume (MPV) has been documented as a simple and inexpensive indicator of inflammation in many diseases. Several papers have suggested its use in CNNA prediction. In this retrospective study, the authors supported this opinion. There are some reservations about the study, which needs revision: 1 Diagnosis of CNNA: It needs to give a detailed criterion of CNNA diagnosis used in this study. In discussion "gold standard for diagnosis is based on the determination of PMN cells count equal or greater than 250 cells /mm<sup>3</sup> of ascites, with or without a positive culture", but in study design "the diagnosis of CNNA according to the American Association for the Study of Liver Disease (AASLD)". Which one was used in this study? 2 It needs to explain the reason why only MPV was recommended for CNNA prediction from so many good predictive variables (leucocytes, PMN count cardiac frequency)? 3 The mistakes in references need to be corrected (e.g. two number 20).

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 16378

**Title:** Mean platelet volume as a novel predictor of systematic inflammatory response in cirrhotic patients with culture-negative neutrocytic ascites

**Reviewer's code:** 00181520

**Reviewer's country:** Egypt

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2015-01-16 16:14

**Date reviewed:** 2015-01-30 17:17

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting study. Minor comments: 1) Abstract: In your aim you wrote: "Determine if there is a difference between mean platelet volume (MPV) value in cirrhotic patients without infection and cirrhotic patients with culture negative neutrocytic ascites (CNNA)." But in the results section, you mentioned that 48 of your 51 patients with ascitic fluid infection were CNNA. I suggest you make the statistical comparison between the 50 patients without infection and the 48 patients with CNNA (not the 51 patients. This should be done if you are going to stick to the aim you wrote). OR YOU CHANGE THE AIM and write that you are comparing between cirrhotic without clinically diagnosed ascitic infection and those with clinically diagnosed ascitic fluid infection. I prefer the first. 2) Please change the word "media" to "median". 3) In the results section, you wrote :Eighty-eight were women (58.3%). Please revise this. It is not correct. 4) In the figure, the line colour of MPV is not clear. Please change it. Thank you