



ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13434

Title: Traditional Chinese Medicine for the prevention and treatment of hepatocarcinoma: from bench to bedside

Reviewer code: 02445433

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-08-23 12:34

Date reviewed: 2014-09-10 22:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review described the role of TCM in prevention and treatment of HCC. This topic is potentially interesting but the content appears not sufficiently sound, the paper too long and without a good structure. First of all the authors fail to clearly describe the basis of TCM investigated. The manuscript is very difficult to read for people who do not know these types of TCM interventions and literature data are too frequently not objectively analyzed. Many references are papers published in China that I haven't found in PubMed home or other library. Moreover, the first part of the review is a mere list of herbal formula without specific and objective information about the experimental results in animal models or in humans. Evidences about the pathological status of the patients in relation to TCM treatments are often lacking. A lot of acronyms are not specified in the text. The part of the review where molecular mechanisms of TCM are described is sounder, but it appears to be poor organized again. Tables 1 and 3 could be more informative with the insertion of humans or animal models used. Table 2 could be more informative adding the histopathological feature of HCC and number of patients treated. As an example of a more comprehensive paper, the authors can read the review of Xu W, Yang G, Xu Y, Zhang Q, Fu Q, Yu J, Yu M, Zhao W, Yang Z, Hu F, Han D, Wang X. The possibility of traditional Chinese medicine as maintenance therapy for advanced nonsmall cell lung cancer. Evid Based Complement Alternat Med. 2014;2014:278917. doi: 10.1155/2014/278917. Epub 2014 Aug 4.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13434

Title: Traditional Chinese Medicine for the prevention and treatment of hepatocarcinoma: from bench to bedside

Reviewer code: 02444952

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-08-23 12:34

Date reviewed: 2014-09-01 09:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this review, the authors described about traditional Chinese medicines for prevention and treatment of hepatocarcinoma. Literature survey has extensively conducted with sufficient references and relevant molecular insight into hepatocarcinoma has also been reviewed. This review is timely considering importance of alternative therapy for hepatocarcinoma. Some minor issues should be clarified before considering a possible publication in this journal.

1. Many herbal formula are noted in Chinese (e.g. Ren-shen-bie-jia-jian) and many references are papers that were written in Chinese, which are not familiar to the general readers in this area.
2. The main goal of this review should be stated at the end of Abstract and introduction.
3. Three Tables contain broad spectra of herbal formula for the therapy of hepatocarcinoma. However, this review may have high impact if the authors show schematic sketch on molecular effects of herbal medicines on multi-component of them and multi-targets in the therapy of hepatocarcinoma.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13434

Title: Traditional Chinese Medicine for the prevention and treatment of hepatocarcinoma: from bench to bedside

Reviewer code: 02861340

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-08-23 12:34

Date reviewed: 2014-11-03 22:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The author described the effect of TCM in hepatocarcinoma. This article is well-written and has a significant value, but the reviewer points out the several concerns below.

- 1) The authors described the effect of TCM on each cellular physiology. But in most of the examples, it is not clear which compounds in TCM are effective, what target proteins are critical for the effect, what is the mode of action for modulating the cellular physiology related with the carcinogenesis. Description these points, if possible, would greatly improve the clarity of the article.
- 2) How the compounds in TCM specifically affect hepatocarcinoma, but not other cancers? It is important to describe this point for each example.
- 3) What are advantages and disadvantages of TCM over the anti-cancer drugs frequently used?
- 4) Major causative agents for developing hepatocellular carcinoma are the chronic infection of HBV and HCV. It would be nice to mention about the effect of TCM on HBV and HCV infection.