

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 24494

Title: Host factors are dominant in the development of post-liver transplant non-alcoholic steatohepatitis

Reviewer's code: 02860895

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-01-25 14:46

Date reviewed: 2016-01-27 22:05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very interesting case report of post-transplant NASH. The split liver transplantation revealed that NASH affected livers but had non-liver causes. Most hepatologists had thought it but had no direct evidence. This report provides the direct evidence to the hypothesis. To amplify the scientific value, latest related articles should be cited. For example, "Prevalence and risk factors of steatosis after liver transplantation and patient outcomes" (Hejilova I et al., Liver Transpl 2015), seems a very important paper for the present case report. In page 9, the size of recurrent HCC should have been described.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 24494

Title: Host factors are dominant in the development of post-liver transplant non-alcoholic steatohepatitis

Reviewer's code: 01221188

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-01-25 14:46

Date reviewed: 2016-01-31 06:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Although there are several differences in the background between two recipients, for instance, child/adult, primary liver disease, and treatment after transplantation, this report is a valuable case report to understand the pathogenesis of steatohepatitis after transplantation. Minor revisions are needed. 1. Higher magnification of histology from the donor liver and case 1 should be shown. 2. There are missing words in the line 11, page 9.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 24494

Title: Host factors are dominant in the development of post-liver transplant non-alcoholic steatohepatitis

Reviewer's code: 02860897

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-01-25 14:46

Date reviewed: 2016-02-10 14:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Split liver transplantation is an interesting experimental system to examine the host factors affecting the development of steatohepatitis in transplanted liver. As authors described in this reports, host factors are divided into changeable factors and unchangeable factors. 1. Authors should compare the changeable and unchangeable host factors in the two recipients. 2. Description of the post transplant clinical course is too simple. Details of the post transplant clinical course should be illustrated in figures that is helpful to accentuate the difference of the both cases. 3. Nowadays, Several SNPs and genetic factors related to the development of NASH have been revealed. Clarify the genetic background as far as possible.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 24494

Title: Host factors are dominant in the development of post-liver transplant non-alcoholic steatohepatitis

Reviewer's code: 03022180

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-01-25 14:46

Date reviewed: 2016-02-11 04:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting case report about post transplant NASH comparing two different scenarios (two different hosts) from a unique donor from a split liver transplant. It proposes that split liver transplant might be an interesting tool to study the pathogenesis of NASH in the post transplant period. I do agree that this might be a very interesting tool to study the pathogenesis of NASH in the post transplant, but more than this split liver transplant may reinforce the importance of the host factors and also donor factors on the long-term outcome of liver transplant. The present case report shows two completely different scenarios one of a baby and the other a host who already has metabolic syndrome in the pre transplant period. The outcome is obviously expected and there is a lot of data considering host factors as crucial for the development of NASH. Although the manuscript lacks originality in this aspect (host factors as predictive factor for NASH development) it proposes an interesting tool to study NASH in the post transplant which is the split liver transplant graft. It is well written and the content is clearly stated. Minor comments: on page 9 line 10-12 there is some mistake concerning the segment of recurrence of the HCC - this should be revised and the phrase



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

rewritten.