

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 25172

Title: Circulating insulin-like growth factor-binding protein 3 as prognostic biomarker in liver cirrhosis

Reviewer's code: 00071220

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2016-02-26 17:05

Date reviewed: 2016-02-27 15:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I had the opportunity to review a paper "Circulating insulin-like growth factor-binding protein 3 as prognostic biomarker in liver cirrhosis", and I found very interesting. There is no problem to publish the manuscript.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 25172

Title: Circulating insulin-like growth factor-binding protein 3 as prognostic biomarker in liver cirrhosis

Reviewer's code: 00005986

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2016-02-26 17:05

Date reviewed: 2016-03-13 01:53

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This study has the aim to investigate the usefulness of serum IGFBP level in clinical practice to assess prognosis in liver cirrhosis. For patients in the stable cirrhosis group, IGFBP level correlates with long term prognosis (25 months), for patients with acute decompensation, it correlates with short term prognosis (80days). This difference should pointed out more clearly in order to avoid inappropriate use. Major points: For short term prognosis, a comparison with the MELD score is missing in the paper: MELD is the most widely used, best validated short term prognostic score, and it is not possible to avoid a comparison with it. An important variable that has not been considered is if the disease causing liver cirrhosis is still active or not (e.g., if HCV has been eradicated). This variable is known to be associated to prognosis. The inclusion criteria for the stable disease group must be extended: e.g., patients with extrahepatic active cancer must be excluded. The majority of the patients in the stable disease group have a history of decompensation, some of them were CHILD B/C. Such patients are not considered as having stable disease. The cut-off levels are different according to the group of patients: this makes its use in clinical practice difficult. Minor points: The



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

first sentence of the Introduction section, which refers to a review on liver cirrhosis published 2008, has to be updated. Cirrhosis is not considered as always irreversible any more. A list of the abbreviations is missing. The definition of active alcohol consumption used in the paper was from a trial in a different context (ref #14). It would be better to use a different definition. The diagnostic criteria used to diagnose liver cirrhosis have to be specified. Only propranolol is considered: no patient on carvedilol or nadolol? Why only data on propranolol and PPI therapy were collected, and no data on other medications? The quality of the English language used should be improved.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 25172

Title: Circulating insulin-like growth factor-binding protein 3 as prognostic biomarker in liver cirrhosis

Reviewer's code: 00053746

Reviewer's country: Czech Republic

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2016-02-26 17:05

Date reviewed: 2016-03-15 20:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors investigated the prognostic significance of IGFBP-3 in patients with cirrhosis. They examined IGF beta in two cohorts of patients (compensated and decompensated). They found that lower IGFBP-3 was associated with worse prognosis in both group of patients. Minor comments: 1. It would be interesting to know, if the levels of IGFBP-3 did differ between patients with different aetiology of cirrhosis? 2. The author should explain, how they get the IGFBP-3 cutoff of 0.86 mcg/mL? 3. Did the IGFBP-3 levels have any prognostic role in the prediction of variceal bleeding? 4. Do the author have any idea, what is the relationship between IGFBP-3 levels and the degree of portal hypertension? Otherwise, the manuscript is well written and I have no major comment.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 25172

Title: Circulating insulin-like growth factor-binding protein 3 as prognostic biomarker in liver cirrhosis

Reviewer's code: 02438768

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2016-02-26 17:05

Date reviewed: 2016-03-16 09:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments for ESPS Manuscript NO 25172 This prospective study investigated the prognostic significance of IGFBP-3 in patients with cirrhosis. This is an interesting study; and this manuscript could provide useful information to readers. There are no major and few minor concerns. Regarding the latter, the format of this manuscript should be revised according to WJG's requirement. In addition, the language need to be improved, for example, on page 16, 2nd paragraph, under Discussion, line 12: Change ' supporting its investigation as a...'to ' supporting its utility as a...'.