

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 25527

**Title:** Metastatic recurrence to a solitary lymph node four years after hepatic lobectomy for primary hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 02462252

**Reviewer's country:** Canada

**Science editor:** Jin-Xin Kong

**Date sent for review:** 2016-03-14 17:29

**Date reviewed:** 2016-03-28 01:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This case documents a late metastasis to a solitary node from a liver cancer. Interesting report.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 25527

**Title:** Metastatic recurrence to a solitary lymph node four years after hepatic lobectomy for primary hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 02444864

**Reviewer's country:** Greece

**Science editor:** Jin-Xin Kong

**Date sent for review:** 2016-03-14 17:29

**Date reviewed:** 2016-03-28 22:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The submitted manuscript presents a case of solitary lymph node metastasis of hepatocellular carcinoma 5 years after hepatectomy including a short review of metastatic HCC to lymph nodes focusing on the importance of surgical treatment. The originality of the case relies primarily on the late recurrence of HCC while surgical resection is considered to be the choice of treatment. Certain corrections and clarifications are necessary. Comments The figures and legends are confusing. The carcinoma depicted in the upper panel corresponds to the primary tumor due to adjacent liver tissue while lymphoid tissue is missing in all 4 figures. The hepatocellular nature of the poorly differentiated metastatic component shown in the lower panel is not unquestionable and immunohistochemical confirmation is required. Hepatic stem cell markers such as keratin 19 should also be examined in order to gain some more information regarding the behavior of the metastatic clone. It is not clear whether metastatic recurrence developed 5 (abstract) or 4 years after hepatectomy (text). There is no comment regarding follow-up.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 25527

**Title:** Metastatic recurrence to a solitary lymph node four years after hepatic lobectomy for primary hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 00051373

**Reviewer's country:** Taiwan

**Science editor:** Jin-Xin Kong

**Date sent for review:** 2016-03-14 17:29

**Date reviewed:** 2016-03-14 23:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

An interesting case presentation with a long period disease-free up to 5 years. It should be benefit to the knowledge of the hepatologists and keep in mind for the importance of clinical follow up after extensive hepatectomy.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 25527

**Title:** Metastatic recurrence to a solitary lymph node four years after hepatic lobectomy for primary hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 00182548

**Reviewer's country:** Romania

**Science editor:** Jin-Xin Kong

**Date sent for review:** 2016-03-14 17:29

**Date reviewed:** 2016-03-25 03:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This case report is very interesting. Sorafenib is not a monoclonal antibody. It is also used in the treatment of acute myeloid leukemia patients carrying internal tandem duplication of fms-like tyrosine kinase 3 (FLT3-ITD) mutation. After prolonged treatment with sorafenib, cancer cells can become resistant to it. But the combination of an inhibitor of the Na<sup>+</sup> / H<sup>+</sup> exchanger can restore the response to sorafenib. (Mihail RG. A minireview on NHE1 inhibitors. A rediscovered hope in oncohematology. Biomed Pap Med Fac Univ Palacky Olomouc Czech Repub 2015 Dec; 159(4): 519-526.) There are several grammatical errors that must be corrected. The bibliography is not properly written.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 25527

**Title:** Metastatic recurrence to a solitary lymph node four years after hepatic lobectomy for primary hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 00069297

**Reviewer's country:** China

**Science editor:** Jin-Xin Kong

**Date sent for review:** 2016-03-14 17:29

**Date reviewed:** 2016-03-21 23:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors described a case of recurrence to a solitary suprapancreatic lymph node five years after initial resection. This case report is important because it offers a strategy of resection as a solution to recurrence to a solitary extrahepatic lesion. The contents would give significant information.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 25527

**Title:** Metastatic recurrence to a solitary lymph node four years after hepatic lobectomy for primary hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 00181532

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Jin-Xin Kong

**Date sent for review:** 2016-03-14 17:29

**Date reviewed:** 2016-03-16 10:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Major comments: 1. The authors need to provide more details on the patient's medical history especially risk factors for developing hepatocellular carcinoma. 2. High AFP level usually is associated with large tumor size, poorly differentiated histology, and macro- and/or microvascular invasion. High AFP is also a risk for tumor recurrence after primary resection. In this case, the authors did not mention if the patient had evidence of microvascular invasion during pathology examination. 3. Sorafenib is not a monoclonal antibody as suggested in introduction. Minor comments: Abstract add '(HCC)' after ... hepatocellular carcinoma Introduction line 2 - suggest changing 'with highest density ...' to 'with the highest prevalence rates ...' line 5 - add 'the' before 'discovery' line 8 - add unit of AFP line 10 - add unit of AFP line 17 - use the full name of OR Discussion line 4 - suggest replacing 'intrahepatic metastases' with 'multifocal tumors'