

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26507

Title: Ohio solid organ transplantation consortium criteria for liver transplantation in patients with alcoholic liver disease

Reviewer's code: 02860653

Reviewer's country: Ukraine

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-04-15 17:12

Date reviewed: 2016-05-06 18:59

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript 'Ohio Solid Organ Transplantation Consortium (OSOTC) Criteria for Liver Transplantation in Patients with Alcoholic Liver Disease' by K. Hajifathalian et al. is an interesting paper and the important contribution from OSOTC group supporting an update of the Criteria for Liver Transplantation based on alcohol abstinence duration potentially help to obtain the transplant for larger group of patients with a low probability of alcohol relapse. Study has number of limitation that were properly indicated and discussed. Article is well-written and might be suggested for acceptance. However, the paper touches sensitive ethical issues, also related to alcohol consumption, which are also country/state-dependent, that probably should be carefully discussed before the final Criteria shift which might much alter the structure of liver transplant waiting list.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26507

Title: Ohio solid organ transplantation consortium criteria for liver transplantation in patients with alcoholic liver disease

Reviewer's code: 02861134

Reviewer's country: Bulgaria

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-04-15 17:12

Date reviewed: 2016-05-07 00:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Article is well-written and might be suggested for acceptance.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26507

Title: Ohio solid organ transplantation consortium criteria for liver transplantation in patients with alcoholic liver disease

Reviewer's code: 00502973

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-04-15 17:12

Date reviewed: 2016-05-08 22:24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the present study, Hajifathalian et al reported the preliminary results of liver transplantation in alcoholic cirrhotic patients adopted either the Ohio Solid Organ Transplantation Consortium or the traditional criteria for assessment of risk of recidivism. They found that a more flexible time of abstinence can be applied in evaluating eligibility for liver transplantation upon careful selection of patients with low to medium risk of recidivism. The results were encouraging although the patients' number is small. I would suggest its acceptance as a preliminary study. I also look forward a multi-center study enrolling more patients to ensure that a shrunken time of abstinence may not result in an increased recidivism rate. Minor concerns: 1. Discussion, 2nd paragraph: Our findings challenge the notion of a defined abstinence period as the only criterion for liver transplant eligibility in patient with liver cirrhosis[18]. I would suggest change "liver cirrhosis" to "alcoholic liver cirrhosis". 2. Discussion, 3rd paragraph: "...intention to remain abstinent form alcohol,...". "form" should change to "from".

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26507

Title: Ohio solid organ transplantation consortium criteria for liver transplantation in patients with alcoholic liver disease

Reviewer's code: 02861252

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-04-15 17:12

Date reviewed: 2016-05-09 06:10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

for the first time, they may have a chance...good work...small number, but good really...

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26507

Title: Ohio solid organ transplantation consortium criteria for liver transplantation in patients with alcoholic liver disease

Reviewer's code: 00502973

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-04-15 17:12

Date reviewed: 2016-05-09 19:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the present study, Hajifathalian et al reported the preliminary results of liver transplantation in alcoholic cirrhotic patients adopted either the Ohio Solid Organ Transplantation Consortium or the traditional criteria for assessment of risk of recidivism. They found that a more flexible time of abstinence can be applied in evaluating eligibility for liver transplantation upon careful selection of patients with low to medium risk of recidivism. The results were encouraging although the patients' number is small. I would suggest its acceptance as a preliminary study. I also look forward a multi-center study enrolling more patients to ensure that a shrunken time of abstinence may not result in an increased recidivism rate. Minor concerns: 1. Discussion, 2nd paragraph: Our findings challenge the notion of a defined abstinence period as the only criterion for liver transplant eligibility in patient with liver cirrhosis[18]. I would suggest change "liver cirrhosis" to "alcoholic liver cirrhosis". 2. Discussion, 3rd paragraph: "...intention to remain abstinent form alcohol,...". "form" should change to "from".

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26507

Title: Ohio solid organ transplantation consortium criteria for liver transplantation in patients with alcoholic liver disease

Reviewer's code: 02860814

Reviewer's country: Greece

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-04-15 17:12

Date reviewed: 2016-05-13 23:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Here are my revisions: I read with great interest the study from Hajifathalian et al on liver transplantation in alcoholic patients. It is indeed a very sensitive issue that every hepatologist often faces and has to do with critical ethical dilemmas. It is a well written paper, which provides significant messages, regarding the allowance of liver transplantation in patients with a recent and insecure abstinence from alcohol consumption. I suggest the acceptance of this study for publication in WJH, after some revisions: - 279 patients (85%) of the total population were considered as high risk for recidivism alcohol consumption and underwent the standard chemical dependency requirements. Do we have data on this population regarding survival, transplant rates, survival after liver transplantation and recidivism after liver transplantation. - 11 patients (47 minus 36) were not approved from the consortium despite they have been considered eligible from social workers and liver transplant committee at the Cleveland Clinic. Which were the criteria for rejection from the consortium? - 17/36 patients dropped off the transplant list. Which were the reasons in details (number, percentages) for drop off. In particular for infections, more details regarding type of



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

microorganisms, type of infection, community or hospital acquired is needed. - Did authors investigate for any factors that could predict recidivism after liver transplantation? - Which were the recidivism rates in the control group? - Are there any information regarding outcome of 4 patients who restart drinking after liver transplantation? Were there any strategies to achieve alcohol cessation again? - Are there any information regarding compliance with immunosuppressive medication regimens? - What were the percentage for patients in both groups with a significant recovery of liver function so that they no longer require transplant.