

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 28077

Title: Novel non-invasive biological predictive index for liver fibrosis in hepatitis C virus genotype 4 patients

Reviewer's code: 03537290

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-06-28 09:58

Date reviewed: 2016-06-30 21:19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. The authors included many parameters, including age, serum glucose, ALT, AST, platelet count, etc. The authors suggested that age is one of the critical parameter related to the accuracy of their model. Therefore, this reviewer would suggest to take into account of the duration of HCV infection if possible, and viral titer. 2. The authors need to provide detailed information of the patients, like gender, age, viral titer etc as supplementary information.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 28077

Title: Novel non-invasive biological predictive index for liver fibrosis in hepatitis C virus genotype 4 patients

Reviewer's code: 01428959

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-06-28 09:58

Date reviewed: 2016-08-17 01:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this study the authors evidenced a non-invasive biological predictive index based on age, HOMA-IR, AST and platelet count for liver fibrosis in hepatitis C virus (HCV) Genotype 4 patients and they compared it with Metavir score and many others non invasive tests. The authors found that it performs better than many other tests in cases of histological mild and severe fibrosis. The study is interesting and shows a good bibliographic study. Major observations 1) The authors ought explain why they selected only HCV genotype 4 cases 2) The authors assessed Metavir fibrosis scoring only on liver section stained with Masson's trichrome stain. Masson's trichrome stain highlights collagen fibrosis, whereas elastic fibrosis, that is very important in chronic hepatitis, is better evidenced by Shikata's orcein. The authors ought report "Cabibi et al, Anal Cell Pathol. 2015.: Comparison of Histochemical Stainings in Evaluation of Liver Fibrosis and Correlation with Transient Elastography in Chronic Hepatitis" about this topic and how these two stainings correlate with fibroscan results in chronic HCV hepatitis. 3) The authors performed Prussian blue for iron staining in all the liver biopsy, but they don't speak about the results and if the presence of iron



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

correlates with liver fibrosis 4) The lack of two observers in the histological assessment of Metavir scoring of fibrosis and the assessment of the interobserver variability is a limitation of this study.

Minor observations: There are some language mistakes, for example: pag 1: Centeres:

Ordinary: better "routinary"

"mason"--> Masson

meteres, centimeters

etc pag15 : 0741-> 0.741 In table 2, 3, 4 p value is often 0.000