

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 27917

Title: Serum gamma-glutamyltransferase fraction patterns in patients with non-alcoholic fatty liver disease

Reviewer's code: 03648154

Reviewer's country: United Arab Emirates

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-06-23 17:28

Date reviewed: 2016-07-13 18:10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Over all a very good article with stimulating prospects and no doubt would be helpful to set a distinguishing point between ALD & NAFLD when it is further validated by large scale studies. Please note the following: Patient selection: The inclusion of the biopsy proven ALDs and NAFLDs is reasonable, however adding the obese patients with no alcohol intake need to be further clarified: - authors admit that H/O alcohol intake is subjectively unreliable therefore assuming that they do not take alcohol is virtual and may not be the case, therefore is not a strong evidence that they have NAFLD. - It should be assumed that these obese patients (16) were examined for viral serology, relevant liver auto antibodies, ferritin, ceruloplasmin, alpha 1 antitrypsin and that the results were within normal. If so is the case they should mention it in the methodology. - The inclusion of cases of cholelithiasis (2) in the analysis does not seem to have relevance to the theme of the study and their data should not be added to the concluded results. -

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 27917

Title: Serum gamma-glutamyltransferase fraction patterns in patients with non-alcoholic fatty liver disease

Reviewer's code: 03478516

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-06-23 17:28

Date reviewed: 2016-07-25 00:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors should discuss also the NAFLD presence without clear increase of GGT, as evident in.....Circulating levels of cytochrome C, gamma-glutamyl transferase, triglycerides and unconjugated bilirubin in overweight/obese patients with non-alcoholic fatty liver disease. J Biol Regul Homeost Agents. 2011 Jan-Mar;25(1):47-56.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 27917

Title: Serum gamma-glutamyltransferase fraction patterns in patients with non-alcoholic fatty liver disease

Reviewer's code: 03478508

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-06-23 17:28

Date reviewed: 2016-07-26 01:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Authors, Congratulations for addressing a highly relevant issue in clinical hepatology practice - The differential diagnosis between NAFLD and ALD. The manuscript provides valuable insights into our understanding of the enzymology of these disorders and paves the way for a large-scale study to validate these preliminary findings. Sincerely, Ivanildo Coutinho de Medeiros

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 27917

Title: Serum gamma-glutamyltransferase fraction patterns in patients with non-alcoholic fatty liver disease

Reviewer's code: 03647837

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-06-23 17:28

Date reviewed: 2016-08-07 04:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript "Serum gamma-glutamyltransferase fraction patterns in patients with non-alcoholic fatty liver disease" presents a possible use of GGT fractionation to differential diagnosis of ALD and NAFLD. However, some aspects concerned this reviewer. Major revision: 1) Throughout the text, the authors expressed the importance of this research in relation to ALD/NAFLD differentiation. The title does not reflect the approach that authors used in these research. 2) The authors used patients in different stages of ALD and non-alcoholic liver disease. This would not be a limiting factor in the research and could not justify the large variation between patients of the same group? 3) Currently, there is strategies to differentiate NAFLD and NAFLD. Authors should explore that in the text. Further details can be found in the review "Molecular basis of alcoholic fatty liver disease: From incidence to treatment" (Hepatology Research 2016; 46: 111-123 - doi: 10.1111/hepr.12594). 4) Why the authors did not perform a plasma biochemistry analyses of "apparently healthy " subjects? Given that ALD/NAFLD is an asymptomatic disease, it would be essential to include these subjects in the control group. Minor revision: 1) In table 1: correct the age of biopsy-proven ALD; 2) References:



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

standardize.