

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 28356

**Title:** Enzymatic pattern of biliary colic: A counterintuitive picture

**Reviewer's code:** 02545516

**Reviewer's country:** Germany

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2016-07-01 17:40

**Date reviewed:** 2016-07-19 04:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript is valuable since it summarizes much of the clinical experience and reflects the (limited) data base of this subject. However, some points should be addressed beforehand: 1) Classification and terminology - biliary colic is an umbrella term to be specified in gallbladder colic and spontaneous passage of bile duct Stones 2) "Medical" (hepatocellular) and "Surgical" (cholestatic) enzyme pattern should be stringently referred to as such. (In addition, given cultural/historical differences in practical patient care of these Patient, such terminology may not be appropriate.) It is the essence of the manuscript that transaminases are the earliest markers of cholestasis - textbook and AASLD differentiation in hepatocellular and cholestatic, however, is basically relevant and used as such for chronic biochemical liver value elevation. 3) The manuscript is interesting and relevant. However, the retrospective nature and thus, in part, self-fulfilling character of the study has to be more critically discussed.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 28356

**Title:** Enzymatic pattern of biliary colic: A counterintuitive picture

**Reviewer's code:** 03494395

**Reviewer's country:** Taiwan

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2016-07-01 17:40

**Date reviewed:** 2016-07-29 14:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript provides the updated evidence to the readers. The topic is an important one and deserves a practical value. I therefore recommend to accept this manuscript for publication.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 28356

**Title:** Enzymatic pattern of biliary colic: A counterintuitive picture

**Reviewer's code:** 03023594

**Reviewer's country:** Taiwan

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2016-07-01 17:40

**Date reviewed:** 2016-08-04 22:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. The authors assumed that exact diagnosis of biliary colic should be presence of stones in the cystic duct or common bile duct. However, without calculus in the gallbladder, how will the stone in the cystic duct or common bile duct come from? The ultrasonic findings of stone in the gallbladder is infrastructure of biliary colic. The authors stated that simple cholelithiasis is "non-contributory" (actually more than half of the cases, 58/100) to biliary colic is illogical. 2. There are 35 cases that ultrasonic findings compatible or highly suggestive of biliary colic had concomitant elevation of liver enzymes. However, we do not see the follow up findings of sonography. If the liver enzymes returned back normal, should the images of biliary tree also have changes? How the changes will be? It is not be easy for a calculus impacted in the cystic duct or common bile duct disappears spontaneously. How to explain the phenomenon that the liver enzymes already fall within normal limit but the ultrasonic findings remain the same? 3. The results of this manuscript are not so attractive. The authors may refer to the following article for the similar information: Acute Transient Hepatocellular Injury in Cholelithiasis and Cholecystitis without Evidence of Choledocholithiasis. World J Gastroenterol 2009; 15: 3788-92. There must be other mechanism to result in elevation of liver



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

enzymes without definite evidence of stone migration from the gallbladder into the cystic duct or common bile duct. 4. The authors should re-write this paper by way of logical thinking before it could be accepted for publication.