

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 29565

Title: Isolated bilateral Tapia's syndrome after liver transplantation: A case report and review of the literature

Reviewer's code: 00054120

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-08-23 12:23

Date reviewed: 2016-08-25 02:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Title: Isolated bilateral Tapia's syndrome after Liver Transplantation: a case report and review of the literature The authors described a case of bilateral Tapia's syndrome in HIV/HCV liver transplant recipient which was due to prolonged intubation and/or frequent attempts at intubation and extubation. It is very rare problem but the authors did literature search and did good educational discussion of the problem. I wonder if the authors can elaborate at the rule of HIV and antiviral medications in the etiology of this case!since it is known that HIV and antiHIV medications can cause neurotoxicity.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 29565

Title: Isolated bilateral Tapia's syndrome after liver transplantation: A case report and review of the literature

Reviewer's code: 00054465

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-08-23 12:23

Date reviewed: 2016-08-29 08:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

A very interesting case report - unique for a patient undergoing liver transplantation but I suspect that the procedure is not as important as the cuff pressure of the endotracheal tube. Some mention of the measurement of cuff pressure during inflation and maintenance should be mentioned.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 29565

Title: Isolated bilateral Tapia's syndrome after liver transplantation: A case report and review of the literature

Reviewer's code: 03262854

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-08-23 12:23

Date reviewed: 2016-09-01 19:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

this is a very interesting case report and a good literature review about the topic.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 29565

Title: Isolated bilateral Tapia's syndrome after liver transplantation: A case report and review of the literature

Reviewer's code: 03645178

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-08-23 12:23

Date reviewed: 2016-09-02 00:20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript is, in general, well written and of interest. There are some use of English errors, which I have corrected (see attached .doc), and some sentences need to be rephrased, which I have marked. Also, I feel that some aspects of the paper need to be cleared: 1.- How is the fact that the surgery was a liver transplantation important to the development of Tapia's syndrome in this case? This is important having in mind that the Journal is oriented to both liver transplantation surgeons AND clinical hepatology (i.e. internists, gastroenterologists...) specialists 2.- Maybe including only bilateral cases could make the case seem how exceptional the case portrayed is. All in all, I think the case reported is special enough, and the revision illustrative, to be shared with the medical community, being not sure of whether the audience of this journal is the appropriate for doing so.