

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21878

Title: Management of human factors engineering-associated hemochromatosis: A 2015 update

Reviewer's code: 02461947

Reviewer's country: France

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2015-08-10 18:48

Date reviewed: 2015-08-11 04:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[] Grade B: Very good	[] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[] The same title	[] High priority for publication
[] Grade C: Good	[] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[] Duplicate publication	[] Rejection
[] Grade D: Fair	[] Grade D: Rejected	[Y] No	[] Minor revision
[] Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	[] Major revision
		[] The same title	
		[] Duplicate publication	
		[] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper is a very well written review by a major reference team in the field, which encompass recent aspect of the management of hemochromatosis. Major comments: - Introduction / HFE related HH: authors should be more cautious in the statement regarding the clinical significance of H63D mutation, compound heterozygotes C282Y/H63D. Confounding factor are frequent in this situation, association to rare HFE mutation have been reported, and few studies are available, therefore the clinical relevance of H63D is still conflicting. Minor comments: -Introduction/iron homeostasis: Ferritin is a 24 subunit protein, not 240

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21878

Title: Management of human factors engineering-associated hemochromatosis: A 2015 update

Reviewer's code: 02962492

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2015-08-10 18:48

Date reviewed: 2015-08-19 14:53

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript "Management of HFE-associated hemochromatosis: a 2015 update" by Sivakumar and Powell is a revision of this genetic illness considering several aspects. I have not found any important flaws in the reasoning of this manuscript, for this reason I think that it could be published without any problem. Minor suggestions: Page 15: Figure 1, line 4, the ferric and ferrous should be corrected. Page 16: Table 1, homyzygosity should be homozygosity

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21878

Title: Management of human factors engineering-associated hemochromatosis: A 2015 update

Reviewer's code: 00467265

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2015-08-10 18:48

Date reviewed: 2015-08-21 23:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Sivamakur and Powell present a review manuscript dealing with HFE-associated hemochromatosis. Their aim is to present an update on this pathology. While the paper is well written and clear (apart from a few minor typos), its content appears to be rather limited to constitute a comprehensive review on a very complex topic. The authors could make an extra effort to implement more literature data in order to make the manuscript more useful to a specialized reader.