

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 28922

Title: Antioxidant effects of aqueous extract of Salep on Paraquat-induced rat liver injury

Reviewer's code: 02446404

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-07-22 16:45

Date reviewed: 2016-07-30 20:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper by Atashpour et al has an interesting rationale and a good background. The results presented are consistent with the effects of the different components of the Salep. However, the extent and quality of evaluation conducted are limited in particular as far as studies on tissue are concerned. Indeed, the evidence of liver damage is based on a not quantitative observation of necrosis and inflammatory infiltrate. A part of necrosis the author stated to observe degenerative changes, proliferation and activation of Kupffer cells (sporadically), increased infiltration of inflammatory cells around the portal vein and in sinusoid space, formation of fibrotic inflamed bridges between liver lobules, and sever cellular ballooning and blood congestion in the sinusoids, progressive liver fibrosis as evidenced by presence of collagen fibers in the liver parenchyma, the portal space and around the central vein in the centrilobular region. However, all these information are not showed in figure, they lack of any quantitative analysis, and most importantly are based only on H&E. It is not accurate not showing carefully the stated observations, and is surprising to obtain all these information just trough one single staining. In definitive, this is a serious limitation of this



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

paper which impairs the degree of evidence sustaining the effects of the Salep and also precludes any understanding of candidate mechanisms. Authors should accurately show and sustain all the results by dedicated analysis (which should be quantified when possible) and labeled figures. A part this basic requirement, the authors could improve the scientific significance of their results by conducting further analysis on serum and on tissue. In particular due to the mechanism associated with the damage and the rescue, I would suggest to evaluate in serum the levels of gamma-GT, fragments of CK indicating apoptosis and fibrosis. In the tissues I would suggest to evaluate more specific and quantitative parameters indicating liver fibrosis (Sirius-Red, collagens deposition), markers of apoptosis, redox damages, mitochondrial impairment. Also it will be interesting comparing the entity of ductular reaction which have been described to be correlated with the entity of the damage of mature hepatocyte which are more likely to be damaged by the insult here provided with respect to the stem cells.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 28922

Title: Antioxidant effects of aqueous extract of Salep on Paraquat-induced rat liver injury

Reviewer's code: 01323395

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-07-22 16:45

Date reviewed: 2016-08-07 18:03

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Abstract: please spell out abbreviations (TOC, TAC) and introduce what salep is Chemicals: please spell out MDA, ALP, TAC, TOC. What TAC and TOC investigate specifically (enzymes, compounds,...? Exp design: the control Group is not necessary since there is a sham-group; How were the doses of salep decided? Discussion: please spell out Trx, Prx, while TOC, TAC, MDA have been already spelled out earlier Tables: the explanation made for the letters is difficult and confusing. Please use another system to indicate significance