

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 28585

Title: Phase 3 trial of first generation protease inhibitor therapy for HCV/HIV coinfection

Reviewer's code: 00227403

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-07-09 15:17

Date reviewed: 2016-08-13 00:05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors report data on efficacy and safety of HCV protease inhibitor boceprevir with pegylated interferon alfa and weight-based ribavirin in a phase 3 trial in patients with HCV plus HIV. The results, in term of SVR, is similar to that reported by other studies in the real world and reflects the limits of this treatment. The authors, correctly, described the chronology of their trial, born before the entry in the clinical practice of the new treatments. In the section I don't see a description of genotype 1 subtype (1a, 1b), have the authors these data? Could the authors made a table describing the results? Could the authors describe if all the other non-viral) causes of liver disease have been excluded? Could the authors confirm that cirrhotics had a stage A Child-Pugh disease?

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 28585

Title: Phase 3 trial of first generation protease inhibitor therapy for HCV/HIV coinfection

Reviewer's code: 00012216

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-07-09 15:17

Date reviewed: 2016-08-23 01:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

K. Sherman et al present the data of a phase 3 clinical trial using Boceprevir+PegIFN+RBV in HIV-HCV G1 co-infected naïve and experienced patients. They described the safety and efficacy in comparison to historic cohorts treated with Peg-IFN+RBV. The results show an SVR improvement with respect to classical therapy, although, as the authors state, these data have been overcome by new direct anti-viral agents (DAA). It makes the interest of this paper mainly academic, since nowadays it would not be ethical to use a boceprevir based treatment due to the higher adverse event rate and lower efficacy than the new DAA.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 28585

Title: Phase 3 trial of first generation protease inhibitor therapy for HCV/HIV coinfection

Reviewer's code: 03488404

Reviewer's country: Hungary

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-07-09 15:17

Date reviewed: 2016-08-23 18:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The topic is outdated since triple combination should not be used any more.