

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 28659

Title: Factors associated with long term survival after liver transplantation: A retrospective cohort study

Reviewer's code: 00504591

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-08-03 14:18

Date reviewed: 2016-08-06 22:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Pischlke et al analyzed the clinical data of the patients who underwent liver transplantation during 1997 to 1999. I have some comments. 1. Patients and methods. Please spell out the abbreviations, BMI, ALT, MELD etc when they first appear in the text. 2. Figure 3 should be omitted of which information is duplicated with that in the Table. 3. The second paragraph of the Discussion section. The reviewer agree with the authors that it is interesting that the donors' BMI or age were not predictors of the prognosis. Please discuss more about the issues referring the other papers.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 28659

Title: Factors associated with long term survival after liver transplantation: A retrospective cohort study

Reviewer's code: 00054585

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-08-03 14:18

Date reviewed: 2016-08-11 17:20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The study is interesting but results must be confirmed by increasing the number of patients in order to have a significant value.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 28659

Title: Factors associated with long term survival after liver transplantation: A retrospective cohort study

Reviewer's code: 01221188

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-08-03 14:18

Date reviewed: 2016-08-10 15:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Major concern 1) Multivariate analysis is needed. Is it true that multivariate analysis is impossible due to the small number of subjects? Did the authors ask a specialist of statistics about this question? 2) There is no data about the medical treatment for each liver disease before and after liver transplantation. Specific medical treatment has a possibility to influence on the survival rate. For instance, if nucleos(t)ide analogues was initiated after liver transplantation, the treatment could contribute to the improvement of survival rate in patients with hepatitis B infection. Minor concern 1) When were the values of GFR, ALT, g-G-GPT, Bilirubin measured in Table 1? 2) The detailed explanation is necessary in Figure 5.