

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 27641

Title: Characteristics of escape mutations from occult hepatitis B virus infected patients with hematological malignancies in Egypt

Reviewer's code: 00225318

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-06-13 19:53

Date reviewed: 2016-06-16 12:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The work addressed by Abeer Elkady et al it is no to original and overall the information provided has been reported in multiple previous studies. In this sense it is well known the problems of detection of the variants studied in this report such as the corresponding to positions 120 and 143 of the MHR region of the HBV genome. This reports only confirms that the methodology used did not adequately detect these variants and this does not represent an important input. The authors confirm that this is a phenomenon of no detection while not due to a lower HbsAg production, but this fact do not contributes too much originality to the study. The authors should have used alternative methods to detect HBsAg in order to know if any of them is able to detect HbsAg in the presence of such variants and recommend its possible use in the population they present. The only interest of this study is the high prevalence of these mutations in patients with hematologic diseases, but the authors do not provide any possible explanatory mechanism for this phenomenon. Surprisingly, the authors get amplify the whole HBV genome from samples with very low viral loads, and they must and provide more experimental data to confirm this. Perhaps this viral loads are underestimated by the



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

methodology they use. They should confirm these viral load with commercial available and well validated methods, validated for HBV DNA quantification. Despite that the authors state that there were no differences in the extracellular HbcAg levels between mutated or WT genomes, Figure 2 seems to suggest that that the extracellular HBcAg in cell culture technique studied by Fujirebio is lower in mutated than WT genomes which contrast with the absence of differences in HBV-DNA levels. The authors do not give any explanation for this phenomenon that might have some interest.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 27641

Title: Characteristics of escape mutations from occult hepatitis B virus infected patients with hematological malignancies in Egypt

Reviewer's code: 02945187

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-06-13 19:53

Date reviewed: 2016-06-27 06:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments to the Authors In this manuscript, Abeer Elkady et al. argue characteristics of escape mutations from occult hepatitis B virus infected patients with hematological malignancies in Egypt. The authors concluded that occult HBV infection is associated with P120T and S143L mutations and 120T mutation impairs the detection of HBsAg by CLEIA. The aim of this study might be interesting and important. There are several comments to be addressed. Minor comments 1. In page 7, line1, authors described that "All patients received chest computed tomography and ultrasonography of abdomen as an initial evaluation." In this study, the imaging findings are not discussed. Authors should remove this sentence. 2. In table 2, diagnosis is lack coherence. For example, authors described that one patient has NHL-small cell-low grade in detail. But authors described that another patient has malignant lymphoma simply. Authors should bring unity in diagnosis in table 2.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 27641

Title: Characteristics of escape mutations from occult hepatitis B virus infected patients with hematological malignancies in Egypt

Reviewer's code: 00053556

Reviewer's country: Egypt

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-06-13 19:53

Date reviewed: 2016-06-27 20:59

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments to the Editor: Thanks for inviting me to review the article entitled "Characteristics of escape mutations from occult hepatitis B virus infected patients with hematological malignancies in Egypt". Minor Comment: ? Editing revision is mandate ? The article needs revision in term of structure and grammar. ? Language evaluation: "C" Comments to Authors: 1. TITLE Reflect the major content of the article; however South Egypt is more specific rather than Egypt. 2. ABSTRACT It includes important data and conclusions, but lacking background and statistical values. 3. INTRODUCTION Provides sufficient background regarding the studied topic, however, redundancy is noticed. The purpose of the study is not clearly defined at the end of this section, it is the prevalence rather than the incidence and this has to be corrected 4. MATERIALS AND METHODS Partially full description is provided for this section and statistical methods are appropriate. Some important issues have to be considered. o Patients: ? Inclusion and exclusion criteria were not clearly identified, whether these patients under chemotherapy, coinfection,..... ? "All patients received chest computed tomography and ultrasonography of abdomen as an initial evaluation."