

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

**Ms:** 3238

**Title:** Probiotics for the Treatment of Clostridium difficile

**Reviewer code:** 00029041

**Science editor:** s.x.gou@wjgnet.com

**Date sent for review:** 2013-04-16 10:42

**Date reviewed:** 2013-04-16 13:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

This is an excellent paper reviewing the current and potential future role of probiotics for Clostridium difficile-associated disease (CDAD). Although the clinical evidence is lacking, Clostridium butyricum MIYAIRI has been widely used for preventing CDAD in Japan. Woo TD, Oka K, Takahashi M, Hojo F, Osaki T, Hanawa T, Kurata S, Yonezawa H, Kamiya S. Inhibition of the cytotoxic effect of Clostridium difficile in vitro by Clostridium butyricum MIYAIRI 588 strain. J Med Microbiol. 2011 Nov;60(Pt 11):1617-25. doi: 10.1099/jmm.0.033423-0. Epub 2011 Jun 23. PubMed PMID:21700738 Seki H, Shiohara M, Matsumura T, Miyagawa N, Tanaka M, Komiyama A, Kurata S. Prevention of antibiotic-associated diarrhea in children by Clostridium butyricum MIYAIRI. Pediatr Int. 2003 Feb;45(1):86-90. PubMed PMID: 12654076

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

**Ms:** 3238

**Title:** Probiotics for the Treatment of Clostridium difficile

**Reviewer code:** 00029041

**Science editor:** s.x.gou@wjgnet.com

**Date sent for review:** 2013-04-16 10:42

**Date reviewed:** 2013-04-16 13:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

This is an excellent paper reviewing the current and potential future role of probiotics for Clostridium difficile-associated disease (CDAD). Although the clinical evidence is lacking, Clostridium butyricum MIYAIRI has been widely used for preventing CDAD in Japan. Woo TD, Oka K, Takahashi M, Hojo F, Osaki T, Hanawa T, Kurata S, Yonezawa H, Kamiya S. Inhibition of the cytotoxic effect of Clostridium difficile in vitro by Clostridium butyricum MIYAIRI 588 strain. J Med Microbiol. 2011 Nov;60(Pt 11):1617-25. doi: 10.1099/jmm.0.033423-0. Epub 2011 Jun 23. PubMed PMID:21700738 Seki H, Shiohara M, Matsumura T, Miyagawa N, Tanaka M, Komiyama A, Kurata S. Prevention of antibiotic-associated diarrhea in children by Clostridium butyricum MIYAIRI. Pediatr Int. 2003 Feb;45(1):86-90. PubMed PMID: 12654076

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

**Ms:** 3238

**Title:** Probiotics for the Treatment of Clostridium difficile

**Reviewer code:** 01944824

**Science editor:** s.x.gou@wjgnet.com

**Date sent for review:** 2013-04-16 10:42

**Date reviewed:** 2013-04-16 21:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

Minor revisions: 1. Discuss the most recent Cochrane Review (citing little evidence to support probiotics in the prevention of CDAD) in light of more recent studies. 2. The discussion of fecal transplantation should be expanded to consider the similarities and differences between this therapeutic approach and the use of probiotics as treatment alternatives.