

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 9433

Title: Genetic and environmental determinants of risk for cholangiocarcinoma and the properties of liver fluke infection-related cholangiocarcinoma in Thailand: Prospects for the future of evidence-based medicine

Reviewer code: 00068443

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-02-20 21:10

Date reviewed: 2014-03-25 22:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this paper, authors reviewed the environmental determinants, the interaction between the genetic and the environmental determinants and the interaction among the genetic determinants. The available evidence is well summarized in the paper. Before publication, the paper would require minor revision: there are two "table 2"; some characters in table 3 are missing after transformation.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 9433

Title: Genetic and environmental determinants of risk for cholangiocarcinoma and the properties of liver fluke infection-related cholangiocarcinoma in Thailand: Prospects for the future of evidence-based medicine

Reviewer code: 02441405

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-02-20 21:10

Date reviewed: 2014-03-26 02:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript summarized the recent research data on the genetic and environmental risk determinants for liver fluke-related cholangiocarcinoma (CCA) and provided interesting perspectives in understanding the molecular pathogenesis and in early diagnosis/prevention of this particular disease. Major concerns: 1. The manuscript reviewed major aspects of the genetic and environmental risk factors for liver fluke-related cholangiocarcinoma across geographic regions, not limited to Thailand. The title, therefore, should be revised. 2. There is no table 1. Table 2 is duplicated. 3. In the preface, authors mentioned that this manuscript would emphasize the importance of genetic data. However, some most important genomic research data are missing (for example, Exome sequencing of liver fluke-associated cholangiocarcinoma, Nature Genetics 2012; 44(6):690-3). Authors need add the updated genomic data into the review. 4. In the perspective, authors may expand more about how the genomic research would aid early prevention and diagnosis. 5. Authors may combine chapters 2 and 3, since both seem to discuss the same type of information in slightly different ways. 6. In page 3, the 7th last line, the statement "primary sclerosing cholangitis (PSA) is an inflammatory bowel disease" (IBD) is incorrect. PSA is associated with IBD, particularly ulcerative colitis, but is not a part or type of IBD. 7. English needs to be polished in a great deal. Need pay special attention to "a" vs. "the", singular vs. plural nouns. Minor concerns:



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

1. Suggest to change "Ever drinker" and "Never drinker" to: "Drinker" and "non-drinker", respectively, in table 2.
2. It is a review article, not a book chapter. Not sure "chapter" used in the review is appropriate.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 9433

Title: Genetic and environmental determinants of risk for cholangiocarcinoma and the properties of liver fluke infection-related cholangiocarcinoma in Thailand: Prospects for the future of evidence-based medicine

Reviewer code: 00926880

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-02-20 21:10

Date reviewed: 2014-03-28 18:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is quite a well-written review on the topic. Unfortunately this is not a systematic review and it therefore has the potential of introducing the authors' personal biases into the review. There are minor points which I have suggested the authors to improve on the paper. The English needs to be improved as well.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 9433

Title: Genetic and environmental determinants of risk for cholangiocarcinoma and the properties of liver fluke infection-related cholangiocarcinoma in Thailand: Prospects for the future of evidence-based medicine

Reviewer code: 00069966

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-02-20 21:10

Date reviewed: 2014-04-01 12:04

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript "Genetic and environmental determinants of risk for cholangiocarcinoma and the properties of liver fluke infection-related cholangiocarcinoma in Thailand: Prospects for the future of evidence-based medicine" by Miwa et al review for the association of genetics change and the impact of environment in the risk of CCA in Thailand. This manuscript worth for publication with major revision: In chapter 6 paragraph 2, the authors mention about the relationship of genetic changes and prognosis of the patients with CCA and give only one example of the amplification of D22S283 in CCA. It would be better if the authors can add more evidence for genetic instability in the other chromosomes such as the corelation between Ch8p22 and CCA progression (Kawaki et al. Int J Cancer 2000 88(2), 228-31.), the prognostic significant of ch 1p36 alteration in CCA (Limpai boon et al. World J Gastroenterol 2006 12 (27), 4377-82) Minor revision: Some errors the authors need to concern: 1.In chapter 1, the authors mention for Table 1 and 2 but in the manuscript showed Table 2 twice (no Table 1) 3. In chapter 3 paragraph 4 line 9, there are duplicate of rs1053781 (..rs1053781 and rs1053781) please check!

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 9433

Title: Genetic and environmental determinants of risk for cholangiocarcinoma and the properties of liver fluke infection-related cholangiocarcinoma in Thailand: Prospects for the future of evidence-based medicine

Reviewer code: 02861409

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-02-20 21:10

Date reviewed: 2014-04-03 00:19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The given review article by Miwa et al. summarizes data about cholangiocarcinoma and liver fluke infections in Asia (Thailand, Japan). The authors divide the manuscript in 6 chapters and they show five tables. To improve the quality of the review article, I like to suggest the following points: - Since the the authors talk about a collabaoration, data from Thailand and Japan should be discussed. - The first chapter I would better change to "Epidemiology". - What are the conclusions of all the data ? There are no final recommendations, etc... - The authors also do not talk about the current way of diagnosis and therapies. I think "Therapy" should be an additional chapter. - Table 1 is missing - Table 3-5 need abbreviations, e.g. GSTM1, etc.