

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11351

Title: THE PATHOGENESIS OF CROHN'S DISEASE: BUG OR NO BUG.

Reviewer code: 00034489

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-05-18 23:38

Date reviewed: 2014-06-16 09:05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors show a recent idea of the pathogenesis of CD in the review. The review is well written and interesting. There are a few concerns with regards to the investigation. Please see below. 1) The figures or tables, which show the main contents to get across the paper, are desired. 2) There are several type errors in the HP section ex. "patients infected with IBD" and "H. pylori".

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11351

Title: THE PATHOGENESIS OF CROHN'S DISEASE: BUG OR NO BUG.

Reviewer code: 00033010

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-05-18 23:38

Date reviewed: 2014-06-16 17:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper of Bosca-Watts et al "THE PATHOGENESIS OF CROHN'S DISEASE: BUG OR NO BUG" is a review about the pathogenesis of Inflammatory bowel diseases (IBD). In detail, Authors focus on infective hypothesis and analyze the role of bacteria, microbiota, viruses and other environmental factors. Main comments are: ? Abstract should not report references. ? Since microbiota is able to influence the damage induced by NSAIDs, a class of drugs which has been invoked as a trigger in the onset and relapse of inflammatory bowel diseases, a short paragraph discussing this aspect may be useful(see Montenegro L et al, Non Steroidal Anti-Inflammatory Drug Induced Damage On Lower Gastro-Intestinal Tract: Is There A Involvement Of Microbiota? Curr Drug Saf. 2014 Apr 24). ? The article is too long. Therefore, a table or a figure summarizing the most important points discussed in the text could be helpful for the reader as well as a procedure of shortening the whole text form 9000 to 4/5000 words. ? Some information given in the text is unnecessary (such as M. avium paratuberculosis-associated disease in ruminants or the description of PCR assay used for its detection, that is too specific, or the role of Rubella virus which is not associated to IBD), so they need to be deleted. ? Although it has been hypothesized that H. pylori could exert an immunomodulatory action on the intestinal mucosa, the protective role of H. pylori on IBD is only an epidemiological observation (see Triantafillidis JK et al, Over-time changes of Helicobacter pylori infection rate in patients with inflammatory bowel disease. J Crohns Colitis. 2013;7(8):681). This point needs to be better detailed and discussed. ? The conclusive remarks are too vague. Authors must suggest a



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

personal view, thus making this paragraph more striking and impressive.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11351

Title: THE PATHOGENESIS OF CROHN'S DISEASE: BUG OR NO BUG.

Reviewer code: 00036023

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-05-18 23:38

Date reviewed: 2014-06-05 17:53

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper relates the various infective hypotheses but as expected leads to more questions than answers. Overall quality is good. Some language issues no doubt as it appears translated. The authors need to declare if it had been published elsewhere in Spanish.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11351

Title: THE PATHOGENESIS OF CROHN'S DISEASE: BUG OR NO BUG.

Reviewer code: 00180739

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-05-18 23:38

Date reviewed: 2014-05-31 20:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review of Bosca-Watts et al is a nicely written story about the role of bacteria and others in Crohns disease. Unfortunately there are already so many of these reviews, even in WJG (Danese et al, Intestinal microbiota in IBD: friend or foe) which are telling more or less similar things. The current review reminds me very much to the one in Nat Rev Gastroenterol Hepatol. 2011 Mar;8:152-68. The role of bacteria and pattern-recognition receptors in Crohn's disease, by Man et al. We do see some eventually new aspects concerning viruses. So it might be better to concentrate on these points, instead of repeating again things which are already known.