

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 19961

Title: New-found link between microbiota and obesity

Reviewer's code: 02441737

Reviewer's country: Mexico

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-05-29 08:48

Date reviewed: 2015-06-09 04:59

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is recommended the title: A New-Found Link Between Microbiota And Obesity: A review of the literature. It is an article of interest due to the limited literature on the subject. However, below there are some recommendations for authors to improve their manuscript. Abstract: It would be of interest that the author would present some of the most relevant results to explain the link between obesity and microbiota. For example, explain more about the link of SCFA microbiota-induced fermentation products and the lipopolysaccharides of Gram-negative microorganisms, with obesity. Introduction: The introduction describes, explains and predicts the study problem. Methodology: In the article the results of a large family of bacteria that naturally inhabit the human intestine, and the diversity of results from several studies where associated with obesity are mentioned. So it is advised to the author, to draw up a table showing the family of each group of bacteria, and present both positive and negative outcomes associated with obesity. For in quantitative terms it can be done to a meta-analysis the results presented. It is advisable to develop a figure or scheme in which the display mechanism by which acetate, propionate, and butyrate; its different patterns of absorption, metabolism and distribution and their



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

relationship to the formation of cholesterol from acetate and the resulting obesity. Using the information on pages 12 and 13, it is recommended to develop a scheme to explain the mechanisms by which the microbiota can influence the genesis of obesity.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 19961

Title: New-found link between microbiota and obesity

Reviewer's code: 02445033

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-05-29 08:48

Date reviewed: 2015-06-08 16:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a review on the relationship between microbiota composition and function and obesity. The text is well written and references seem to be updated. I would like to make some comments.

- In some areas, the text seems a bit reiterative. For instance, the description of the relationship between short-chain fatty acids and obesity, both protective and causal, is commented in the introduction, the "short-chain fatty acids" section, and in the "role of SCFAs" section. The author should shorten and summarize some of these sections.
- Overall, reading the article is a bit hard going. Perhaps adding some figures (for instance, for the microbiota description) or tables (for instance, for the different effects of SCFAs on obesity and their mechanisms) would make it more friendly for the reader.
- There are also some typos to be fixed