

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 31525

**Title:** Differential diagnosis in ulcerative colitis in an adolescent: Chronic granulomatous disease needs extra attention

**Reviewer's code:** 00057910

**Reviewer's country:** Italy

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2016-11-24 16:41

**Date reviewed:** 2016-12-08 18:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a paper of a clinical case in which a misdiagnosis of chronic granulomatous disease in an adolescent undergoing total colectomy for suspected ulcerative colitis is reported. The english language needs revision. This paper does add not information to current literature.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 31525

**Title:** Differential diagnosis in ulcerative colitis in an adolescent: Chronic granulomatous disease needs extra attention

**Reviewer's code:** 00035901

**Reviewer's country:** Japan

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2016-11-24 16:41

**Date reviewed:** 2016-11-24 21:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This case report was well organized and well investigated. This paper will give us a new information especially in the field of IBD, I have no claim in the present study.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 31525

**Title:** Differential diagnosis in ulcerative colitis in an adolescent: Chronic granulomatous disease needs extra attention

**Reviewer's code:** 00003692

**Reviewer's country:** Canada

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2016-11-24 16:41

**Date reviewed:** 2016-11-25 23:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [ Y] Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [ Y] Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [ Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [ Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [ Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very interesting case and well documented. I thought that a photomicrograph of the colitis and the ileal pathology might be very useful. In addition, is it possible to provide some figure or photograph on the NBT test?

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 31525

**Title:** Differential diagnosis in ulcerative colitis in an adolescent: Chronic granulomatous disease needs extra attention

**Reviewer's code:** 02926997

**Reviewer's country:** Iran

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2016-11-24 16:41

**Date reviewed:** 2016-11-26 14:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Associate Editor, Thank you for sending the article (ID: 31525) for review. The manuscript reports a case of CGD that was treated as ulcerative colitis for a long period of time. Finally it was diagnosed of CGD was confirmed biologically by a nitroblue tetrazolium test (NBT) and flow cytometry-based dihydrorhodamine (DHR) or 2'-dichlorofluorescein diacetate (DCFDA) assays. There are some comments to improve the quality of the article as the followings: 1-Please define clearly the criteria used for the diagnosis of ulcerative colitis. The diagnosis is based on the clinicopathological basis. Please explain this statement: "Surgical material found to be compatible with ulcerative colitis." 2-Please demonstrate the pathological slides of colectomy sample in the manuscript. 3-Please provide the Pelvic MRI and fistulography. 4-Crohn disease is not ruled out in this case. In my opinion investigation about the mal absorption profile, ASCA assay, and MR enterography is of great importance in this case. 5-The figure one and four could be substituted with colonoscopic view, MR fistulography and pathology slides.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pathophysiology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 31525

**Title:** Differential diagnosis in ulcerative colitis in an adolescent: Chronic granulomatous disease needs extra attention

**Reviewer's code:** 00041468

**Reviewer's country:** Hungary

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2016-11-24 16:41

**Date reviewed:** 2016-11-28 02:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Very interesting case report, but some points are not clear to me. - Were there any data about previous suppurative infections in the case history of the patient? If not, it is quite unusual in case of CGD. - Was the presence of any Mycobacterial infection excluded? - How was the diagnosis of UC established? - How were the patient's basic immunological parameters like ? (exact blood cell counts and percentages, immunoglobulin levels, complement levels) - Include the histological examination of the bowel. - Which type of CGD was diagnosed? - Was a cytochrom C reduction assay performed? What was its result? English language needs minor polishing. After major revision I suggest to accept the manuscript for publication.