

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pharmacology and Therapeutics

ESPS manuscript NO: 31664

Title: Thiol/disulphide homeostasis in celiac disease

Reviewer's code: 03261349

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-12-02 20:29

Date reviewed: 2016-12-11 01:22

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the present paper, entitled "Thiol/disulphide homeostasis in celiac disease", Kaplan et al measured thiol/disulphide homeostasis, an indirect evaluation for oxidative stress, in patients with celiac disease. Main comments: A minor linguistic revision is necessary. It is unclear whether enrolled celiac patients were first diagnosed (i.e. during gluten containing diet) or received a gluten free diet (GFD). Despite the results refer to a response to GFD, thus explicating that some patients had GFD, and moreover in Table 2 a comparison GFD vs GCD is present, this detail should be clearly stated in the "Methods" section. Anyway, it would have been interesting to evaluate thiol/disulphide homeostasis before and after GFD. Indeed, GFD could bring positive effects on oxidative damage. The definition of poor compliance to diet is cloudy. Did the patients have positive anti-transglutaminase antibody despite GFD? In table 3, Authors found a direct correlation between age and thiols. This is a strange finding, since one may expect that the process of aging could increase oxidative damage. A correlation between thiol/disulphides and severity of villous atrophy (Marsh classification) is lacking. Indeed, it is possible that the higher the severity of mucosal lesions, the higher the inflammation (see Ierardi E et al, Saudi J Gastroenterol 2015), and the higher the oxidative



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

stress. In conclusion, although the results are interesting, there are several bias and inaccuracies that must be clarified by the Authors.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Pharmacology and Therapeutics

ESPS manuscript NO: 31664

Title: Thiol/disulphide homeostasis in celiac disease

Reviewer's code: 02938579

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-12-02 20:29

Date reviewed: 2016-12-20 05:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript presents an interesting study that evaluates the dynamic thiol/disulphide homeostasis in celiac patients. The study involves 73 patients with celiac disease and 73 healthy volunteers. The results show that there is a negative correlation between celiac autoantibodies, and native thiol, total thiol levels and native thiol/total thiol ratio, while a positive correlation is suggested between disulphide, disulphide/native thiol and disulphide/total thiol levels. In conclusion this study proposes that the patients with celiac disease the dynamic thiol/disulphide balance shifts through disulphide form compared to the healthy individuals. Minor revisions required: ? Minor language polishing and mistapeing : in the introductio and statistical analysis. ? The same group recently published thiol/disulphide balance shifts in IBD, would be interesting to compare in the text the different pathologies ? If available would be interesting to add the levels of Vit D in these 146 individuals; there are data about the impact of this vitamin on the thiol and disulphide levels. ? Please add for how long the celiac patients were in GFD (or at least indicate the minimal time) and if they show any persistance of mucosal inflammation