

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3157

Title: Primary Renal Carcinoid tumor; rare cystic renal neoplasm

Reviewer code: 00200474

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-04-11 21:09

Date reviewed: 2013-04-23 13:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

To the Authors: MS # WJR-2013-3157 Primary renal carcinoid tumor; rare cystic renal neoplasm

General comments In this case report, the authors reported a rare case of primary renal carcinoid and reviewed previous reported literatures. As a primary renal cystic mass, primary renal carcinoid is very rare and the imaging findings are not known well, although we can meet imaging findings in review articles. Initially, radiologists diagnose it as cystic renal cell carcinoma (Bosniak category IV cyst). Thus, radiologists should need to be familiar to CT findings of a rare, primary renal carcinoid. Generally, this review article is well-written. However, there is something to be changed or added in the mainbody.

Specific comments

Titles: OK

Abstract: Generally, the terminology of "corticomedullary and nephrographic phases" in kidney dynamic CT is preferred to the use of early and delayed phases. Thus, I would recommend the use of corticomedullary and nephrographic phase.

Introduction: OK

Case report Please change 'early phase or delayed phase' into 'corticomedullary phase or nephrographic phase'. In CT findings, please add your differential diagnosis in the mainbody.

Discussion Of primary renal masses, mixed epithelial and stromal tumor and synovial sarcoma can show cystic and solid, solid and cystic feature. Thus, please add short discussion as differential diagnosis. I would recommend deletion for brief overview of Bosniak renal cyst classification.

References: Error in published year for reference 20. Please clarify it.

Figures: Fig. 2: Please change 'equilibrium phase' into "nephrographic phase". Fig. 3: Please add 'arrows' on the figures.