

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14509

Title: Ovarian thecal metaplasia of the adrenal gland in association with Beckwith-Wiedemann syndrome: a case report

Reviewer code: 02793333

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2014-10-09 08:18

Date reviewed: 2014-10-09 17:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The present paper presents a single case of the radiological representation of a rare pathology of ovarian thecal metaplasia in a premenopausal women diagnosed with Beckwith-Wiedemann syndrome. Topic, text an conclusion are clear. The relevant literature is covered. There ar only minor corrections needed. 1. Patient data could include genotype. 2. Figures 1-3 should display orientation (R, L) and metric scaling, if possible. Black boxes should be one size.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14509

Title: Ovarian thecal metaplasia of the adrenal gland in association with Beckwith-Wiedemann syndrome: a case report

Reviewer code: 00713469

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2014-10-09 08:18

Date reviewed: 2014-10-09 23:10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

GENERAL COMMENTS The authors present a case report on incidentally discovered finding of ovarian thecal metaplasia of the adrenal gland in a patient complying with Beckwith-Wiedemann syndrome. The paper is well written and sustained by appropriate iconography. Since it has been presented as case report we consider it appropriate if the journal holds space for case report. Although the article is essential in its structure, the purpose is well defined and it transmits properly the message becoming of potential interest for the readers. **SPECIFIC COMMENTS** Title: is appropriate. Abstract: well-defined and it seems to be in accordance with the text. Images: appropriate References: correct **MINOR ISSUES** On page #3 the HU values reported are not the same mentioned in figure legend 2. Please verify! T

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14509

Title: Ovarian thecal metaplasia of the adrenal gland in association with Beckwith-Wiedemann syndrome: a case report

Reviewer code: 00724431

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2014-10-09 08:18

Date reviewed: 2014-10-11 01:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very interesting paper. The authors described radiological features of the unique adrenal pathology in Beckwith Wiedemann syndrome. Rarity of this lesion makes each publication on this topic relevant. I fully support the publication of this paper. There are however a very few weak points which should be corrected and revised before final acceptance. 1. It would be important to bring more details about the previous medical history of the presented patient. What kind of surgical treatment had been undertaken in this case before adrenal tumor was found. She had bilateral Wilms tumor and pancreatic neuroendocrine tumor ! 2. The authors should be more precise in description of the surgical technique. First they mention laparotomy and later they claim the patient had underwent laparoscopy. Why did the surgeons performed pancreatic resection? Final pathology of the resected specimen of the distal pancreas has not been reported at all. 3. The authors have focused on radiological aspects of the adrenal lesion what I fully understand. On the other hand I regret that the pathological description of the adrenal tumor is so scarce. One of the author represents the Department of Pathology. Was histology the sole technique performed? . What about immunohistology and other more sophisticated modern diagnostic techniques. Their results might help to elucidate pathogenesis of ovarian thecal metaplasia or at least add important data for others studying this topic. It is pity that the authors have contributed so little to this aspect.