

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 24479

Title: Relative volume measured with magnetic resonance imaging is an articular collapse predictor in hematological pediatric patients with femoral head osteonecrosis

Reviewer's code: 00289451

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-01-27 16:36

Date reviewed: 2016-02-16 01:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper aims at establishing if the volume of the necrotic portion of the femoral head might be a valid predictive parameter of femoral head collapse in pediatric patients affected by osteonecrosis treated for haematological malignancies. The study was performed through several MRI imaging techniques on 114 young patients and a good correlation was found between the necrotic volume and following femoral head collapse. Even if a larger study population would be recommended these initial findings are interesting and deserve publication.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 24479

Title: Relative volume measured with magnetic resonance imaging is an articular collapse predictor in hematological pediatric patients with femoral head osteonecrosis

Reviewer's code: 02577402

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-01-27 16:36

Date reviewed: 2016-02-21 20:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors investigated the relative volume as an articular collapse predictor in hematological pediatric patients with femoral head osteonecrosis. Some problems existed. 1. Language: The language needs to be improved because of some grammar mistakes. 2. Title: The title is not good based on the purpose and results of the study. It should best be changed to "Relative volume measured with magnetic resonance imaging is an articular collapse predictor in hematological pediatric patients with femoral head osteonecrosis". 3. Abstract: In this part, what does 23 mean in the parentheses? Please specify in the abstract. Is there a significant ($P < 0.05$) difference in the evaluation value of articular collapse between RELATIVE VOLUME AND ARTICULAR SURFACE? If a significance does exist, the conclusion may be good. Or else it is not good. 4. Key words: Please delete "Lower limbs". 5. Results in the text: same question as in the abstract: Is there a significant ($P < 0.05$) difference in the evaluation value of articular collapse between RELATIVE VOLUME AND ARTICULAR SURFACE? If a significance does exist, the conclusion may be good. Or else it is not good. 6. Table: What does 0.05 in the table mean? In the text, it said that the threshold is 0.5. Here, it



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

became 0.05. Which is correct? Is there a significant ($P < 0.05$) difference in the evaluation value of articular collapse between RELATIVE VOLUME (RV) AND RELATIVE SURFACE (RS)? Please give the P value here.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 24479

Title: Relative volume measured with magnetic resonance imaging is an articular collapse predictor in hematological pediatric patients with femoral head osteonecrosis

Reviewer's code: 02348457

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-01-27 16:36

Date reviewed: 2016-02-25 22:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors retrospectively reviewed femoral MRI in young patients treated for haematological malignancies. They found that the volume of the necrotic portion of the femoral head might be a parameter highly predictive of future collapse of femoral head affected by osteonecrosis also in young patients treated for haematological malignancies. However, the collapse of femoral head might be associated with other parameters, such as bone density, BMI, the treatment of steroid, activity, etc. The authors only investigated femoral MRI. Moreover, ROI analysis was used to test the predictive value of femoral head. But the positive number of cases was small, only 13 patients and Logistic regression analysis might be appropriate to deduce the conclusion, as it can control other compounding factors.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 24479

Title: Relative volume measured with magnetic resonance imaging is an articular collapse predictor in hematological pediatric patients with femoral head osteonecrosis

Reviewer's code: 02346872

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-01-27 16:36

Date reviewed: 2016-02-28 19:54

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Title: The main title accurately reflects the major topic and content of the study. **Abstract:** The abstract present the advantages and significant points related to the aim, materials and methods, results, and conclusions. **Materials and Methods:** The methods sufficiently described for the MR scanning. The parameter of IMAGE ACQUISITION, are particular, technical and repeatable. **Results:** The results provide some data to draw scientific conclusions. **Discussion:** This preliminary data show that the volume of the necrotic portion of the femoral head might be a parameter highly predictive of future collapse of femoral head affected by osteonecrosis also in young patients treated for haematological malignancies. **Figures:** The image size and resolution is appropriate for this study. **Overall:** This is a prospective, technical and interdisciplinary study conducted in the assessment of ROC. This preliminary data show that the volume of the necrotic portion of the femoral head might be a parameter highly predictive of future collapse of femoral head affected by osteonecrosis also in young patients treated for haematological malignancies.