

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23753

Title: Unusual presentation of Erdheim-Chester disease in a child with acute lymphoblastic leukemia

Reviewer's code: 02445127

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2015-12-18 09:27

Date reviewed: 2016-02-03 13:49

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|---|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | BPG Search: | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review manuscript by Archana George Vallonthai et al entitled "Unusual presentation of Erdheim-Chester disease in a child with acute lymphoblastic leukemia" contains some clinically interesting findings as case report. This manuscript needs to be improved for the acceptance to "WJG". Question1. Page6. "The association of ALL and ECD, similar to our case, has been reported only in a single child; but she had osteolytic lesions in multiple long bones and skull bones without any osteosclerosis [5]." A possible mechanism between ALL and ECD, including the present case, could be described. Question2. Summary table for Erdheim-Chester disease is required. Question3. Differential diagnosis table for Erdheim-Chester disease is also desirable.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23753

Title: Unusual presentation of Erdheim-Chester disease in a child with acute lymphoblastic leukemia

Reviewer's code: 02836238

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2015-12-18 09:27

Date reviewed: 2016-02-11 16:25

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|--|--|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | BPG Search: | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting, well written and documented case report. Discussion: too long in my opinion. It is an in deep review on the topic rather than a discussion on the possible relationship between osteolytic lesions in ECD and ALL . This point should be more stressed.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23753

Title: Unusual presentation of Erdheim-Chester disease in a child with acute lymphoblastic leukemia

Reviewer's code: 03501898

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2015-12-18 09:27

Date reviewed: 2016-01-15 16:26

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|---|--|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | <input type="checkbox"/> No | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | BPG Search: | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is an excellent, well-written and documented work. It would be interesting to include PET/CT images (MIP and axial thoracic views, for example) in order to clarify the extensive bone involvement and possible lung infiltration, observed only by this test. In this vein, it would be interesting to note the role of 18F-FDG PET/CT in the initial staging, determine the degree of multisystem involvement and assessment of treatment response. It may be helpful to refer to: García-Gómez FJ, Acevedo-Báñez I, Martínez-Castillo R, et al. The role of 18FDG, 18FDOPA PET/CT and 99mTc bone scintigraphy imaging in Erdheim-Chester disease. Eur J Radiol. 2015;84(8):1586-92. doi: 10.1016/j.ejrad.2015.04.022.