

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Radiology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 29365

**Title:** Potential role of imaging in assessing harmful effects on spermatogenesis in adult testes with varicocele

**Reviewer's code:** 02884690

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Shui Qiu

**Date sent for review:** 2016-08-11 10:22

**Date reviewed:** 2016-08-20 23:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors present a comprehensive review of imaging for assessment and followup of varicocele and the importance of the detection and treatment in the arena of spermatogenesis. This is a nicely written manuscript with clearly outlined goals, well flowing prose, and comprehensive citations from the body of literature on this subject. This manuscript is highlighted as an "Editorial" but perhaps should be considered a "Review" as it is a well-bodied review of the primary data from a number of different primary source articles. Consider adding the role of diagnosing recurrent or persistent varicoceles following primary treatment. Specifically, address the role of angiography to define the anatomic drainage in cases of recurrent or persistent varicoceles post ligation. This imaging approach is both diagnostic as well as therapeutic as selective angioembolization has been reported in a salvage setting: Rais-Bahrami et al, J Endourol, 2012. Sze et al, J Vasc Interv Radiol, 2008. Nabi et al, Urology, 2004.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Radiology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 29365

**Title:** Potential role of imaging in assessing harmful effects on spermatogenesis in adult testes with varicocele

**Reviewer's code:** 02488710

**Reviewer's country:** Taiwan

**Science editor:** Shui Qiu

**Date sent for review:** 2016-08-11 10:22

**Date reviewed:** 2016-08-16 22:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

General comments: This paper suggested that the functional imaging techniques, including US and MRI might provide early indications of testicular dysfunction in testes with varicocele. This paper provides much useful clinical information. Specific comments: 1. Most urologists will not suggest using MRI for the diagnosis of varicocele. Authors might discuss this issue. 2. What is the role of nuclear medicine for the evaluation of varicocele? 3. What is the role of embolization for the treatment of varicocele? 4. This paper needs English revision.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Radiology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 29365

**Title:** Potential role of imaging in assessing harmful effects on spermatogenesis in adult testes with varicocele

**Reviewer's code:** 03271645

**Reviewer's country:** South Korea

**Science editor:** Shui Qiu

**Date sent for review:** 2016-08-11 10:22

**Date reviewed:** 2016-08-22 08:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This editorial manuscript is efficacy of diagnostic image study in varicocele patients. Moreover, author mentioned about period of treatment in varicocele patients with impaired spermatogenesis. And, it is very interesting about correlation testicular MRI image results with varicocele. However, I think that conclusion of this manuscript dose not match to title. In title, there is something correlation between spermatogenesis and results of image study. However, there is no mention about this, and no study about correlation of both. The manuscript is too long to read and the general and clinical explanation of varicocele too much.