

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 29767

Title: Gd-EOB-DTPA based MRI for predicting liver response to portal vein embolization

Reviewer's code: 03537672

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-08-29 14:44

Date reviewed: 2016-11-21 08:55

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The critical deficit of this study is the absence of descriptions for PVE procedure. Authors should clarify the segments undergone PVE, i.e. right portal vein, right portal vein with P4 branches, left portal vein with anterior branch... Usually, PVE for colorectal liver mets is performed for the right portal vein with or without the embolization of P4s. In this sense, the kGR should be evaluated for S2, S3 and S1. I do not think authors correctly understand the surgical strategy of PVE to secure the postoperative liver dysfunction.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 29767

Title: Gd-EOB-DTPA based MRI for predicting liver response to portal vein embolization

Reviewer's code: 02346872

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-08-29 14:44

Date reviewed: 2016-12-06 19:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors evaluated the response to PVE (based on kGR calculations) and the degree of hepatic function (based on the enhancement of the liver with Gd-EOB-DTPA). Their hypothesis is that the degree of enhancement of the liver following the intravenous administration of Gd-EOB-DTPA at the hepatobiliary phase will correlate and predict the kinetic growth rate of the liver following portal vein embolization. They demonstrated that although Gd-EOB-DTPA has increasingly shown to be a very powerful tool for the evaluation of liver disease, the enhancement of this agent during the hepatobiliary phase does not predict the degree of liver hypertrophy following PVE.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS manuscript NO: 29767

Title: Gd-EOB-DTPA based MRI for predicting liver response to portal vein embolization

Reviewer's code: 01560036

Reviewer's country: Russia

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-08-29 14:44

Date reviewed: 2016-08-29 16:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Good-weighted and useful article.