

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Cardiology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8193

Title: Arrhythmogenic Ventricular Cardiomyopathy: A Paradigm Shift from Right to Biventricular Disease

Reviewer code: 00258928

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-12-20 14:25

Date reviewed: 2013-12-25 16:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors present a comprehensive review of arrhythmogenic ventricular cardiomyopathy and point out the need for a paradigm shift to realize the diverse clinical picture of the disease with involvement of both ventricles in many cases.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Cardiology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8193

Title: Arrhythmogenic Ventricular Cardiomyopathy: A Paradigm Shift from Right to Biventricular Disease

Reviewer code: 02522696

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-12-20 14:25

Date reviewed: 2014-01-03 01:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[] Grade B (Very good)	[] Grade B: minor language polishing	[] Existed	[] High priority for publication
[] Grade C (Good)	[] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[] No records	[] Rejection
[] Grade D (Fair)	[] Grade D: rejected	[] Existed	[] Minor revision
[] Grade E (Poor)		[] No records	[] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this review the authors described the epidemiology, pathogenesis, clinical presentation, diagnosis, prognosis and risk stratification of arrhythmogenic ventricular cardiomyopathy. The paper is very interesting and clearly written. There are some suggestions: 1. The authors should report the role of the 3D echocardiography in the diagnosis and prognosis of arrhythmogenic ventricular cardiomyopathy, as well as the new technology, in particular 2D strain.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Cardiology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8193

Title: Arrhythmogenic Ventricular Cardiomyopathy: A Paradigm Shift from Right to Biventricular Disease

Reviewer code: 02565578

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-12-20 14:25

Date reviewed: 2014-01-04 06:44

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript constitutes an updated overview of arrhythmogenic ventricular cardiomyopathy and describes the paradigm shift in the understanding of AVC from an isolated right sided entity to biventricular disease, as described in 2010 task force criteria. I would just like to point out that the term "arrhythmogenic cardiomyopathy" is used by the authors when they introduce the acronym AVC. This acronym corresponds to "arrhythmogenic ventricular cardiomyopathy", as correctly acknowledged in the abstract, hence this term should be also used in the first sentence of introduction. Pathogenesis section could be better organized and follow a more logical order, starting from "genetically-determined disruption of intercalated disc integrity", followed by "loss of desmosomal integrity can substantially affect gap junctions... in the absence of overt structural damage" (this part is included in Genetics section) and ending with "the theories for progressive fibro-fatty replacement of the myocardium". As regards the latter, point 2: hypothesis of transdifferentiation of myocytes into fibroblasts and adipocytes has been already rejected and should be abandoned. Few grammar mistakes and typos should be corrected.