

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Biological Chemistry

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4437

Title: Autophagy and Cancer

Reviewer code: 00503759

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-06-29 21:23

Date reviewed: 2013-07-01 11:35

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|---------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | language polishing | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well-written and well planned out review on the topic of autophagy and cancer. The article would be greatly enhanced by the addition of a cartoon or diagram showing the major pathways involved in the process, and specific factors which are affected during carcinogenesis.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Biological Chemistry

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4437

Title: Autophagy and Cancer

Reviewer code: 02446204

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-06-29 21:23

Date reviewed: 2013-07-01 12:11

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|---------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | BPG Search: | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This minireview is well written as a whole, compactly explaining an important issue of how autophagy is involved in tumorigenic regulation. This review has successfully illustrated a clear and well-organized schema regarding the roles of autophagy, which will inspire readers to explore new subjects to be investigated. Nevertheless, some parts of the text are rather hard to follow. The content of this review will be more easily understood if the following parts are revised. 1) Page 5, line 7. The word "tumorigenesis" would better be replaced by the word "tumor suppression", thus changing the sentence "Subsequent studies with mouse models further established the role of autophagy in tumorigenesis" into "Subsequent studies with mouse models further established the role of autophagy in tumor suppression". 2) Page 5, line 13-15. Expressions with more detailed explanations, referring the names of the tumor suppressor genes, would help readers to obtain the image more quickly, without stopping to check the referred papers. For example, "Apart from the experimental evidence, tumor suppressive role of autophagy is also supported by the observation that tumor suppressive genes frequently participated in autophagy signaling" should better be replaced by "Apart from the experimental evidence, tumor suppressive role of autophagy is also supported by the observation that tumor suppressive genes, such as p53 and ARF, participated in autophagy signaling" 3) Regarding the issue of chemotherapy, which are written in the 2nd paragraph in the session of "Autophagy and tumor maintenance, and its role in chemotherapy" (Page 6, line 24 – page 7, line 4), both positive and negative roles of autophagy are written. To mention its positive roles, which is related to anti-tumorigenic effects, in this session, whose main purpose is to explain its tumorigenic effects, might introduce confusion into readers' minds. Thus, I strongly suggest that the story regarding chemotherapy would be written in an independent session.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

For example, the name of the session “Autophagy and tumor maintenance, and its role in chemotherapy” would better be replaced by, for example, “Autophagy as an antitumorigenic mechanism” deleting the whole part of the 2nd paragraph, which would be written in the subsequent session with a name, for example, “Roles of Autophagy in chemotherapy”.