ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Biological Chemistry
ESPS manuscript NO: 18806
Title: SGF29 and Sry pathway in hepatocarcinogenesis
Reviewer's code: 01585205
Reviewer's country: China
Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji
Date sent for review: 2015-04-29 16:13
Date reviewed: 2015-05-06 12:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good		[ ] Duplicate publication	
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[Y] Minor revision
	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Major revision
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript Nobuya Kurabe et al proposed that Sry is an upstream regulator of SGF29. They showed that the up-regulation of SGF29 may contribute to the overexpression of c-Myc in human HCC, thus promotes the progression of HCC. The written text is well organized, clear, and concise. However, several concerns should be addressed before its publication. 1) c-Myc was deregulated in many cancer types, does the Sry-SGF29-c-Myc axis contribute to other cancer, such as prostate cancer or other male-specific cancer? These should be discussed in the manuscript. 2）Are there any other upstream regulators of SGF29, except Sry? Do they also play some role in SGF29-c-Myc axis in the progression in HCC? These issues should also be discussed.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Biological Chemistry
ESPS manuscript NO: 18806
Title: SGF29 and Sry pathway in hepatocarcinogenesis
Reviewer's code: 02446126
Reviewer's country: Czech Repoublic
Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji
Date sent for review: 2015-04-29 16:13
Date reviewed: 2015-05-11 19:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good		[ ] Duplicate publication	
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Minor revision
	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Major revision
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Manuscript (review) is well written, shows important data on c-myc functioning during cancerogenesis. Authors would like to publish their contribution to the knowledge on oncogenic potential of the c-myc gene. They summarized that histone acetyltransferase complex, STAGA, is crucial for malignant cell transformation, which is initiated via the c-myc pathway. Summarizing Fig. 1 shows principles on hepatocarcinogenesis. This is sufficient for publication in WJBC.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Biological Chemistry
ESPS manuscript NO: 18806
Title: SGF29 and Sry pathway in hepatocarcinogenesis
Reviewer's code: 02495425
Reviewer's country: United States
Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji
Date sent for review: 2015-04-29 16:13
Date reviewed: 2015-05-12 09:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language	[ ] The same title	[Y] High priority for
[ ] Grade C: Good	polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	publication
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor	language polishing	[Y] No	[ ] Minor revision
	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Major revision
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript is particularly well written, and it should be of great interest to the readers. Kurabe et al. demonstrated that 1) SFG29 contributes to oncogenic potential of c-Myc in hepatocellular carcinoma. 2) Sry as the upstream of SFG29 is increased in HCC. 3) Male specific HCC driven by SGF29 and Sry.   The concerns are the following: 1. On page 3, line 13, the "ribomome" should be "ribosome". 2. On page 6, line 1, "dpecific" should be "specific". 3. Can you discuss more about the third group of the SAGA complex subunits?   4. Fig 1, you should put H3K4me2/3 in. It will easier for readers. 5. Proofreading by a native speaker may help significantly.