

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Biological Chemistry

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 19846

**Title:** RNA-binding proteins related to stress response and differentiation in protozoa

**Reviewer's code:** 00467115

**Reviewer's country:** Austria

**Science editor:** Xue-Mei Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2015-05-29 10:29

**Date reviewed:** 2015-08-17 17:21

| CLASSIFICATION                                    | LANGUAGE EVALUATION  | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT                          | CONCLUSION   |
|---|--|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing     | Google Search:                                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                        |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good       | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing           | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication |  |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism            | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected                           | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No         | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                |
|   |  | BPG Search:                                    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision     |
|   |  | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        |  |
|   |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication |  |
|   |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism            |  |
|   |  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No         |  |

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Alves and Goldenberg review in their article RBPs in protozoa with an emphasis on stress response and differentiation. In the first part they give very brief summaries of some of the domains commonly found in RBPs, however these are far too short in order to give the reader any clear picture. Thus, for example, the authors do not really make clear why RBPs need in addition to the RBD and RRM – and what the functional difference between the two is. A figure of a “typical” RBP with its domains and their functions would be very helpful. Unfortunately the second part (RBPs in protozoa) again reads more like a list than like an article. In the present form, not much would be lost by shortening this chapter to the last paragraph – as the table provides most of the information of the chapter. However, this chapter should be considerably extended to a critical review of the literature. It is somewhat confusing that the authors chose many examples from the vertebrate world – why, for example MDM2 as an example for alternative splicing when the article concerns protozoa? In general, this review has potential but should be much more detailed and critical. minor issues: line 140: formatting problem. line 145: With regard to splicing line 248: cases line 268: cytochrome C is not a complex!



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

### ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Biological Chemistry

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 19846

**Title:** RNA-binding proteins related to stress response and differentiation in protozoa

**Reviewer's code:** 00541708

**Reviewer's country:** France

**Science editor:** Xue-Mei Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2015-05-29 10:29

**Date reviewed:** 2015-06-24 23:21

| CLASSIFICATION   | LANGUAGE EVALUATION  | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT                          | CONCLUSION   |
|--|--|--|--|
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing     | Google Search:                                 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept             |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing           | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good                 |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication |  |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism            | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected                           | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No         | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                |
|  |  | BPG Search:                                    | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                |
|  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        |  |
|  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication |  |
|  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism            |  |
|  |  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No         |  |

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors provide a high quality review on the role of RNA binding protein in the context of stress and differentiation in protozoa. The review is well written and raised main questions and perspectives in the research field.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Biological Chemistry

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 19846

**Title:** RNA-binding proteins related to stress response and differentiation in protozoa

**Reviewer's code:** 00609371

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Xue-Mei Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2015-05-29 10:29

**Date reviewed:** 2015-07-28 10:47

| CLASSIFICATION                                    | LANGUAGE EVALUATION   | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT                          | CONCLUSION   |
|---|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent       | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing                 | Google Search:                                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                        |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication |  |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing  | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism            | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected                            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No         | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision     |
|   |   | BPG Search:                                    | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                |
|   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        |  |
|   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication |  |
|   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism            |  |
|   |   | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No         |  |

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This article reviewed and updated the roles of RNA-binding proteins (RBPs) in the cellular response to physiological stress, in cell differentiation, and in the cellular localization of certain mRNAs, especially in Trypanosoma. Generally speaking, this is a concise and fairly well-written manuscript that covered a quite a few important yet underappreciated areas. However, I believe this article could be better if the following issues are appropriately addressed: 1) General introduction is absent. 2) Even though the 1st subtitle is "RNA-binding proteins", the most part was actually devoted to discussion the different domains of RNA-binding proteins, therefore the subtitle need to be modified to reflect the content. 3) Figure 1 is oversimplified to be useful. The authors need to add more details, such as P body and stress granules, to appropriately reflect the current understanding of the field. Typo: "139 cell survival. For example, a 43-kDa protein takes 0.625 seconds to diffuse a distance of 10 μm[46]"

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Biological Chemistry

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 19846

**Title:** RNA-binding proteins related to stress response and differentiation in protozoa

**Reviewer's code:** 00338280

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Xue-Mei Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2015-05-29 10:29

**Date reviewed:** 2015-08-01 22:44

| CLASSIFICATION                                    | LANGUAGE EVALUATION   | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT                          | CONCLUSION   |
|---|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent       | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing                 | Google Search:                                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                        |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication |  |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing  | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism            | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected                            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No         | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                |
|   |   | BPG Search:                                    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision     |
|   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        |  |
|   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication |  |
|   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism            |  |
|   |   | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No         |  |

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments: In this manuscript, Alves and Goldenberg reviewed published studies on the roles of RNA binding proteins in stress response and differentiation. Previous studies have demonstrated that, through specific association with RNA, the RNA binding proteins regulate the function and fate of RNA molecules. Overall the review provides collective information into the mechanisms of RNA binding protein. Given the importance of RNA binding protein in human disease, the topic is of general interest. The manuscript is well written. However, the manuscript suffers from deficits that need to be carefully addressed. The authors should have added their comments to the related studies, rather than just to pile up the published studies. The audience would look for deeper mechanisms for RNA binding protein functions. The opinion from the authors is very important. The authors may want to expand the section for the important roles for RNA binding protein functions during stress response, because this is supposed to be the major topic of the review.