

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Biological Chemistry

ESPS manuscript NO: 29240

Title: L-carnitine protects C2C12 cells against mitochondrial superoxide overproduction and cell death

Reviewer's code: 02799783

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-08-05 17:14

Date reviewed: 2016-08-05 20:20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript is interesting. The main objective study was to evaluate the beneficial effect that L-carnitine treatment may exert on muscle cells undergoing an oxidative stress. In the present study, the authors described that L-carnitine may act on the intracellular ROS status either by decreasing mitochondrial ROS production, either by increasing defense against these reactive molecules produced in mitochondria, or either by scavenging ROS at the mitochondrial level. Good work.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Biological Chemistry

ESPS manuscript NO: 29240

Title: L-carnitine protects C2C12 cells against mitochondrial superoxide overproduction and cell death

Reviewer's code: 02613582

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-08-05 17:14

Date reviewed: 2016-08-10 11:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1、 Autophagy is a lysosomal degradation pathway that is essential for survival, differentiation, development, and homeostasis. There are many markers for autophagy in addition to LC I/II. The authors should provide more evidence. 2、 In page11: "Microtubule-associated protein light chain 3 (LC3) is considered as one of the more accurate marker for autophagy." The "marker" should be "markers". 3、 The four figures lack symbols and the key to symbols. 4、 Figure1A lacks X axis. Figure1B is not clear and the "A B C D" is too small. 5、 Figure2A : The "A B C D" should not be in the figures. The X axis and the Y axis should intersect. X axis label should be time (hour). Font sizes of X and Y axis label should be consistent. 6、 Figure2B lacks X axis. 7、 Figure 3: The two figures should be labeled A and B. The Y axis label should be "The ratio of LC3-I /II". 8、 Figure 4 lacks X axis.