



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Clinical Oncology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8340

Title: Exercise in patients coping with breast cancer: review

Reviewer code: 02494289

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-12-26 14:01

Date reviewed: 2014-01-23 03:09

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|---|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a review article about the effect of exercise in patients with breast cancer and the current perspective. The authors discussed novel and attractive strategies, such as strengthening and aerobic exercises for achieving physiological and psychological improvements of patients' quality of life. Is it clear and concise paper with precise title and brief and concise abstract. The paper is very interesting and the rationale for this work is solid. Presented results are largely novel and the manuscript is suitable for publication in the journal.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Clinical Oncology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8340

Title: Exercise in patients coping with breast cancer: review

Reviewer code: 02521111

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-12-26 14:01

Date reviewed: 2014-01-26 17:22

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|---|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very interesting paper. Metodology is correct.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Clinical Oncology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8340

Title: Exercise in patients coping with breast cancer: review

Reviewer code: 02685237

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-12-26 14:01

Date reviewed: 2014-02-09 04:53

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|--|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | | BPG Search: | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review attempts to present a current perspective on recently published data on the effect of exercise in patients with breast cancer. I have several concerns with this review: ? The introduction lacks several references and does not do a good job describing the need for this review. One sentence states "Although, the additional effect of exercise in breast cancer has been investigated in numerous studies throughout the last decades, there have been no clear consensus or a standard approach yet", but this is not explained further nor are these studies references. ? In the section "Effects of Exercise in Breast Cancer" there is no description as to how the research articles discussed in this review were found. I would suggest following the appropriate PRISMA format for a systematic review. ? The remainder of the paper lacks structure and is difficult to follow. ? A review of exercise in breast cancer survivors has been done in the past and I would recommend the authors review the following papers which were not referenced: o Jones, L. W., Pituskin, E., & Battaglini, C. L. (2012). Exercise Training in Oncology: Systematic Review and Clinical Practice Recommendations. The Health & Fitness Journal of Canada, 5(1), 47-63. o McNeely, M. L., Campbell, K. L., Rowe, B. H., Klassen, T. P., Mackey, J. R., & Courneya, K. S. (2006). Effects of exercise on breast cancer patients and survivors: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Canadian Medical Association Journal, 175(1), 34-41. o Speck, R. M., Courneya, K. S., Masse, L. C., Duval, S., & Schmitz, K. H. (2010). An update of controlled physical activity trials in cancer survivors: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Journal of Cancer Survivorship, 4(2), 87-100. Additional concerns are listed below: Introduction ? The following lacks references: For many years, breast cancer has been like a nightmare for women and health care providers with its high mortality and morbidity rates. ? The following lacks references: However due



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

to recent advances in diagnosis and treatment of breast cancer, survival rates have increased. ? The following lacks references: Due to the high prevalence of breast cancer especially in developed countries, the increased rates of survival as well as the high expectations in the quality of life for women with breast cancer ultimately led health care providers to seek for alternative or additional approaches in the management of cancer. ? The following is unclear and lacks references: There have been many researches within the medical community about the relationship of exercise and breast cancer. ? The following lacks references and is unclear: Days that breast cancer survivors are advised to rest and avoid physical activity have also passed and both patients and the medical community are seeking for ideal physical activity. ? Please provide references and explain why there is no clear consensus for the following statement: Although, the additional effect of exercise in breast cancer has been investigated in numerous studies throughout the last decades, there have been no clear consensus or a standard approach yet. Indications & Contraindications ? The following lacks references: Indications for the exercise treatment in this patient population include to regain or improve physical functions, aerobic capacity, strength, flexibility, body image, body composition, quality of life, the ability to withstand physically and psychologically to any current and future cancer treatments and to withstand the anxiety with the current or recurrent disease.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Clinical Oncology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8340

Title: Exercise in patients coping with breast cancer: review

Reviewer code: 00267956

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-12-26 14:01

Date reviewed: 2014-02-16 02:48

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|--|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | | BPG Search: | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It's more an overview than a review. This should be amended in the title, since a review, although it is a qualitative review, the methodology includes search, selection of information and qualitative analysis of the selected studies, as well as the scale used to grade the evidence, etc. If the authors want to present a review as objective as possible, it is suggested to use QUORUM checklist, except in the statistical section. No hay análisis metodológico de los estudios revisados. Throughout the text, in the introduction and in the title and abstract it seems that the review it about women with breast cancer, but in the section "Core tip" the authors talk about breast cancer survivors. Also in the introduction they mix both women with breast cancer and breast cancer survivors. It's confusing. Clarification is needed here. References misquoted. Review is needed....