

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Clinical Oncology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8527

Title: The current role of modern radiotherapy techniques in the management of breast cancer: An Evidence-Based Review of Current Literature

Reviewer code: 02510166

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2013-12-30 13:51

Date reviewed: 2014-01-01 01:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper is excellently written. I have however a concern. Hypofractionated radiotherapy in breast cancer can be either partial, or whole breast. Partial breast irradiation is well covered in the review. But the latter, whole breast hypofractionation, is entirely missing. Yet, whole breast hypofractionation is evolving to become the new standard in breast therapy (refer to the editorial by Haffty, Lancet Oncology October 2013,14:1032, commenting on the START-A trial in the same issue). I believe that a paragraph should be devoted to that topic, with at the least a Table listing whole breast hypofractionation trials, e.g. Table 6 in <http://www.biomedcentral.com/1471-2407/12/495>

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Clinical Oncology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8527

Title: The current role of modern radiotherapy techniques in the management of breast cancer: An Evidence-Based Review of Current Literature

Reviewer code: 01191832

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2013-12-30 13:51

Date reviewed: 2014-01-13 03:19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper is generally well written, however the authors should consider a few comments in order to improve the quality of their manuscript. 1. While the issues of cutaneous toxicity and cosmetic results are thoroughly discussed, cardiotoxicity is just mentioned, but no data are reported and discussed. The authors should improve the discussion on this important topic. 2. In most controlled studies of IMRT the standard arm is represented by 2D RT, that should be considered an outdated approach. The authors should underline this issue in their discussion of published data. 3. The paragraph on APBI with external beam radiotherapy should be improved by discussing ongoing trials such as NSABP 39/RTOG 0413 and similar randomized studies.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Clinical Oncology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8527

Title: The current role of modern radiotherapy techniques in the management of breast cancer: An Evidence-Based Review of Current Literature

Reviewer code: 02352047

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2013-12-30 13:51

Date reviewed: 2014-01-18 10:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Major comment The manuscript picked up an interesting topic concerning modern radiotherapy techniques for treatment of breast cancer. But the author's definition of the word of modern is ambiguous and the contents and references should be described in more arranged order. Image guided radiotherapy and respiratory management are also modern techniques, so they should be described separately from IMRT. Minor comments It will be better for IMRT to be described in the three manners of forward planning IMRT, inverse optimization of the weighting of beams (Aperture-based IMRT), and inverse planning IMRT. The quality of tables is poor. Figures showing the modern radiotherapy should be demonstrated. What differs between the words of radiation therapy and radiotherapy? What differs between the words of regimen and schedule? The word of 3DCRT should be spelled out completely.