

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Clinical Oncology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8734

Title: The Ly6/uPAR protein C4.4A as a biomarker in non-small cell lung cancer

Reviewer code: 01212616

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-01-04 19:26

Date reviewed: 2014-01-19 20:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. What experimental methods dose this paper use to obtain the resulting picture 2.This paper only made a review for squamous cell carcinoma and adenocarcinoma which is not entirely representative of non-small cell lung cancer, however the title of the paper is about non-small cell lung cancer biomarkers 3.References required uniform format 4.what advantages dose it has compared with other tumor markers, and what is the future research directions.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Clinical Oncology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8734

Title: The Ly6/uPAR protein C4.4A as a biomarker in non-small cell lung cancer

Reviewer code: 02676238

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-01-04 19:26

Date reviewed: 2014-01-26 22:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

C4.4A is a cell membrane protein, roles as a potential biomarker in in non-small cell lung cancer. In this paper, the author give a review of the role of C4.4A in NSCLC, which is valuable and attracts great interests for the researchers in this field.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Clinical Oncology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8734

Title: The Ly6/uPAR protein C4.4A as a biomarker in non-small cell lung cancer

Reviewer code: 02148395

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-01-04 19:26

Date reviewed: 2014-02-13 07:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review "The Ly6/uPAR protein C4.4A as a biomarker in non-small cell lung cancer" by Jacobsen et al. describes the prognostic and predictive validity of C4.4A in non-small cell lung cancer. Being expressed in suprabasal layers of stratified squamous epithelia, it is absent from healthy bronchial and alveolar tissue, but present at early stages of lung cancer. Surprisingly, it is also expressed in a fraction of pulmonary adenocarcinoma, which correlates with poor survival and a solid growth pattern. Additionally, there appears to be an inverse relationship between C4.4A and the tumor suppressor LKB1. The authors first introduce lung cancer, new therapeutic concepts based on TKI and point out that new biomarkers are also relevant for improving prognosis, one of these markers being C4.4A. The authors introduce C4.4A expression in health and disease and then focus on C4.4A in pulmonary squamous cell carcinoma. The authors explain that C4.4A expression correlates with the differentiation status and not malignant potential, but might be involved in transdifferentiation. In the following chapter the authors are concerned about rare and weak expression in AC. They describe that C4.4A expression is tightly correlated with the solid growth pattern and is a stronger prognostic factor than solid growth. The further speculate that C4.4A-positive AC are of the squamoid type and on the inverse correlation with the tumor suppressor LKB1. This is a very thoroughly and well written review on C4.4A. I have only one concern that the second part is too lengthy such that the potential reader gets tired and loses interest. The review would greatly profit, when the authors try to significantly shorten the second part.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Clinical Oncology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8734

Title: The Ly6/uPAR protein C4.4A as a biomarker in non-small cell lung cancer

Reviewer code: 02519158

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-01-04 19:26

Date reviewed: 2014-02-17 02:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This article is well designed and brings honest, professional and interesting information on molecular biomarkers of lung cancer. It will be useful for molecular biologists and oncologists who in their practice encounter questions of cancer biomarkers. I recommend this article for publication in World Journal of Clinical Oncology.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Clinical Oncology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8734

Title: The Ly6/uPAR protein C4.4A as a biomarker in non-small cell lung cancer

Reviewer code: 02445433

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-01-04 19:26

Date reviewed: 2014-02-19 20:04

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors describe the knowledge on Ly6/uPAR protein C4.4A and its role as biomarker in non-small cell lung cancer. The paper is well written and underlines the potential usefulness of C4.4A as marker in AC and in SCC patients. Moreover the possible role of C4.4A as an early diagnostic tumor marker in precursor lesions is discussed too. To further clarify for the readers the potential role of C4.4A in NSCLC as a marker, it should be reported a table resuming the finding about C4.4A expression in lung tissues and its relation with the progression of the disease.