

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15745

Title: Optimal management of the elderly patient with Head and Neck Cancer: Issues regarding surgery, irradiation and chemotherapy

Reviewer code: 00503729

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2013-11-13 16:08

Date reviewed: 2013-11-23 17:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Very long paper, however very interesting and comprehensive. -At the end of the sub-session "Particular aspects", I would recommend to add few words and references on the use of pedicled flaps as alternative to free flaps in weak elderly patients (i.e. infrahyoid flap, supraclavicular artery island flap, etc.) - page 13 line 12, please replace "prophylactic" with "elective" - please check appropriateness of all references (i.e. n.83 pag 13, n.87 pag 14, n.182 Gebbia is 139, n.184 page 26 not appearing in the list) - numerous references are not respecting the progressive numeration please check it for all references (i.e. n.26, 63, 71, 74, 83, 87, 127, 111, 122, 149, 159, 182)

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15745

Title: Optimal management of the elderly patient with Head and Neck Cancer: Issues regarding surgery, irradiation and chemotherapy

Reviewer code: 00535653

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2013-11-13 16:08

Date reviewed: 2013-11-29 00:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Congratulations to the author for the extensive review

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15745

Title: Optimal management of the elderly patient with Head and Neck Cancer: Issues regarding surgery, irradiation and chemotherapy

Reviewer code: 02277329

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2013-11-13 16:08

Date reviewed: 2013-11-16 17:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review article covers an important issue. There is an increasing number of elderly H&N cancer patients. Management and the decision process can be complex. Although this is a usual review it is unclear as to how the literature review was performed e.g the search engines, number of papers, inclusion and exclusion criteria etc. There are a number of important papers missing from the reference list. There is no indicator of fidelity and how much this represents one view on the interpretation of the literature sampled.