

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 17025

Title: Unusual case of malignant peripheral nerve sheath tumor of proximal third tibia

Reviewer's code: 00742254

Reviewer's country: Malaysia

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-02-08 16:32

Date reviewed: 2015-02-12 10:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors described a case of malignant periphery nerve sheath tumour in a 16 years old male teenager. This tumour is rare in young adult and hence worth reporting. However, there are a few concerns. 1) In abstract, A malignant peripheral nerve sheath tumor (MPNST) (also known as "Malignant schwannoma," "Neurofibrosarcoma," and "Neurosarcoma") is a form of malignancy of the connective tissue surrounding nerves. The underline words are redundant because it was stated again in the next sentence. Suggest removing it. 2) In introduction, the statement "In general, a sarcoma arising from a peripheral nerve or a neurofibroma is considered to be a MPNST [1,2]." should be reference from a review article or textbook. 3) In figure 2, there should be only one legend, suggest removing the one above the figure. 4) In figure 4-7, it would be clearer to use only one or two of the images for each figure. The figure is too small to appreciate the tumour. 5) In figure 9 (histology), was the diagnosis made based on H&E alone or with the help of immunohistochemical study? Usually spindle cell neoplasm required immunohistochemical study to confirm. In this case, usually S100 is used for confirmation. Could the author include a figure of IHC? 6) In figure 9 and 10. The sequence is incorrect and please removes the "no" in "figure no 9". 7) The references were not



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

standardised. 8) English editing and correction of typo errors are required.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 17025

Title: Unusual case of malignant peripheral nerve sheath tumor of proximal third tibia

Reviewer's code: 00506472

Reviewer's country: Greece

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-02-08 16:32

Date reviewed: 2015-04-24 21:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is a well written paper describing an interesting case report of Malignant Peripheral Nerve Sheath Tumour (MPNST) Of Proximal Third Tibia Treated By En-Bloc Resection. Few comments to be considered: 1. Please provide past medical history of the patient, especially any event that may predispose to MPNST (eg. radiation exposure). 2. Please clarify that no signs of neurofibromatosis (a situation that predisposes to MPNST) are evident in the patient. 3. Please provide the results of appropriate molecular test for MPNST in the patient (eg. p53 and p16) or explain why was not done. 4. Page 6, last sentence: please explain why the patients was advised to receive additional chemotherapy and not radiotherapy (both treatments are considered only partially effective). 5. Page 8, last sentence: "Although with recent approaches with the molecular biology of MPNSTs, new therapies and prognostic factors are being examined". Please give some more details. 6. Text need editing (for example please correct "improved" to "improved", "instututional" to "institutional" etc.)