

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 20046

Title: Therapeutic role of template-based lymphadenectomy in urothelial carcinoma of the upper urinary tract

Reviewer's code: 00580279

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-06-01 12:03

Date reviewed: 2015-07-13 15:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Kondo et al. reviewed the current status of lymph node dissection (LND) in upper tract urothelial carcinoma (UTUC) patients underwent radical nephroureterectomy (RNU). They have a lot of experience in this field and in fact they up-dated their surgical outcome in the review paper. The review article is written in a clear manner. Other minor comments are listed below. 1) The authors described that LND could have therapeutic benefit in UTUC patients underwent RNU. On the contrary, especially in renal pelvic cancer, LND could reduce local recurrence and might improve cancer specific survival. The reviewer recommends to overview the therapeutic benefit of LND especially in ureteral tumor. 2) The difference of mode and complication of LND between transperitoneally and intraperitoneally need to be discussed in detail. 3) The reviewer agrees with the survival benefit of LND in patients with advanced UTUC. On the other hand, urothelial cancer has chemo-sensitive, then survival improvement in advanced UTUC is due to not only template LND but also adjuvant chemotherapy. The authors need to discuss this point. 4) The authors introduced that three guidelines are currently available for UTUC. As now another guideline from Japanese



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

Urological Association (Evidenced-based clinical practice guideline for upper tract urothelial carcinoma (summary--Japanese Urological Association, 2014 edition)., Oya M, Kikuchi E; Committee for Establishment of Clinical Practice Guideline for Management of Upper Tract Urothelial Carcinoma; Japanese Urological Association. Int J Urol. 2015 Jan;22(1):3-13.) is also available, the reviewer could refer the guideline.