



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Orthopedics

**Manuscript NO:** 43288

**Title:** Patents and Intellectual Property in Arthroplasty and Orthopaedics

**Reviewer's code:** 02691156

**Reviewer's country:** Greece

**Science editor:** Ying Dou

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2018-12-14 14:40

**Reviewer performed review:** 2018-12-17 15:18

**Review time:** 3 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The title is referring directly to the problem at hand. The abstract is sufficient. Key words reflect the focus of the manuscript. Introduction is extensile and clear. Material and Methods are described under the following subchapters: [Intellectual property, Patent, Patent Expiry and financial Sequelae, Generic Orthopaedic Implants, Approval of



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

Generic Devices, Point of Entry of Generic Implants into Healthcare Systems: Some old or Brand New?, Patent Trolls and The Abuse of, Intellectual Property Protection]. Although you have conducted an extensive search and you are describing your work as review, you are not indicating what studies you are evaluated, neither you mention criteria of acceptance or exclusion used. Results are missing as a separate chapter. Discussion also is missing as a separate chapter, although part of it is included to the various subchapters, Conclusions “[...]. However cost saving cannot come at the expense of patient safety. [...].The emergence of equivalent implants may herald a commercial renaissance for global healthcare [...].” Limitations Although, in the submitted manuscript there is a multitude of citations for generic orthopaedic implants, discussion and results are not provided as a whole in separate chapters but only in the various subchapters. The impression that advertising a company is included weakens the scientific value of the present work. This is the limitation of the submitted manuscript, apart from the deviation from the established writing structure. References are cited appropriately the latest references while the submitted manuscript is supported by 57 references. The submitted manuscript is aiming to explore patents and their repercussions for musculoskeletal care. Advertising a company that produces generic implants it is not within physician’s scientific interest. Scientific community’s interest is to ensure that the quality of the generic implants remains high, accessible and continuous.

## **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

### ***Google Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA

**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242

**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243

**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

[ Y ] No

***BPG Search:***

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[ Y ] No



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Orthopedics

**Manuscript NO:** 43288

**Title:** Patents and Intellectual Property in Arthroplasty and Orthopaedics

**Reviewer's code:** 01220036

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Ying Dou

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-01-02 14:15

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-01-02 14:17

**Review time:** 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

accepted-interesting read

**INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

*Google Search:*



# Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Orthopedics

**Manuscript NO:** 43288

**Title:** Patents and Intellectual Property in Arthroplasty and Orthopaedics

**Reviewer's code:** 02710967

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Ying Dou

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-01-03 20:13

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-01-05 15:24

**Review time:** 1 Day and 19 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Well written manuscript that discusses important issues.

**INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

*Google Search:*



# Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No