

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

Manuscript NO: 66526

Title: Atypical Osteochondroma of the Lumbar Spine Associated with Suprasellar Pineal
Germinoma: A Case Report

Reviewer's code: 00738726

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Assistant Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Iran

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2021-04-01

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-04-18 18:44

Reviewer performed review: 2021-04-18 19:31

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors presented a case report of lumbar atypical osteochondroma in an 18 year old patient with prevoius history of radiotherapy for suprasellar carcinoma and discussed the literature. Thia is a concise, but very well written case report. My main concerns are:

1. The authors are recommended to well describe the main pathology of suprasellar tumor. Is it a Squamous cell carcinoma? If so, SCC within a suprasellar tumor is a rare entity and its association with an osteochondroma is really scarce in the literature. 2. Intracranial SCC requires whole brain radiotherapy (WBRT) and not total body radiotherapy (TBI). Therefore, I am strongly disagree with the conclusion that the lumbar osteochondroma is the result of radiotherapy for suprasellar SCC. Instead, I would call it a spontaneous osteochondroma associated to supraaellar SCC. 3. The authors are recommended to provide sagittal CT images depicting the involvement of L5/S1 facet joint to justify the use of bone scalpel to resect the tumor.