

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5359

Title: Isolated Dorsal Approach for the Treatment of Neglected and Complicated Volar Metacarpophalangeal Joint Dislocations: A Report of Three Cases

Reviewer code: 00503636

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-02 17:59

Date reviewed: 2013-09-09 10:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

There is no assessment of pain after last follow up.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5359

Title: Isolated Dorsal Approach for the Treatment of Neglected and Complicated Volar Metacarpophalangeal Joint Dislocations: A Report of Three Cases

Reviewer code: 00501331

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-02 17:59

Date reviewed: 2013-09-11 02:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors present the case report "Isolated Dorsal Approach for the Treatment of Neglected and Complicated Volar Metacarpophalangeal Joint Dislocations: A Report of Three Cases." The report is nicely written and well analysed, only the figures needed to be worked out for size and matching of the good illustrations.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5359

Title: Isolated Dorsal Approach for the Treatment of Neglected and Complicated Volar Metacarpophalangeal Joint Dislocations: A Report of Three Cases

Reviewer code: 00467048

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-02 17:59

Date reviewed: 2013-09-28 17:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper has to be checked for correct grammar and spelling, preferably by a native speaker. Important details like Range of Motion, pain and strength are not satisfactorily documented. Please describe ROM according to international guidelines (extension- neutral- flexion). It has to be clarified, whether there were two cases with three dislocations or two patients with three cases. Generally a case is understood to be one patient. I would prefer to change the title in either "... A report of three dislocations." or "... A report of two cases with three dislocations."