

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10801

Title: Overweight and obesity in hip and knee arthroplasty: Evaluation of 6078 cases

Reviewer code: 00505434

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2014-04-20 18:30

Date reviewed: 2014-04-22 10:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This retrospective study, conducted at a single medical center with high volume of total joint arthroplasty, showed some interesting findings. Although low evidence, it does add new information to the field. The study was well conducted with detailed data analysis. The conclusion is validated. I do have a few minor concerns: On page 4, the authors hypothesized "that obese patient were treated with later stage of OA and more conservative implants like cemented total hip arthroplasties (THA) and constrained total knee arthroplasties (TKA)". The word "conservative" is confusing and misleading, similarly on page 7, the authors stated: "super-obese patients were treated much more conservatively than overweight or normal weight patients", again, the word: "conservative" is inappropriate. I recommend the authors to edit these sentences to make it more meaningful and easy to understand. Studies have shown that patients with morbid obesity do have increased risk for peri-operative complications, however, this study did show similar findings. This could be because patient population treated at this medical center were relatively healthier. Unfortunately, the authors did not provide detailed information regarding comorbidities in their study subjects. I recommend authors to add this piece of information. The manuscript needs some help from English editor to polish the language.

ESPS Peer-review Report**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Orthopedics**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 10801**Title:** Overweight and obesity in hip and knee arthroplasty: Evaluation of 6078 cases**Reviewer code:** 00503176**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji**Date sent for review:** 2014-04-20 18:30**Date reviewed:** 2014-05-31 16:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

this text requires a major revision. however, even if it could be appropriately revised, it is of limited relevance.