

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 11408

Title: Total Hip Arthroplasty for Surgical Management of Advanced Tuberculous Hip Arthritis – A Case Report

Reviewer code: 02977122

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-05-20 21:28

Date reviewed: 2014-07-15 02:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments The authors relate an important question for clinical medicine, as surgical methods TB arthritis are described, however, lack in the success operational and to require more information to the problem discussed, the present study may to be accept. Although, suggest some corrections, as describe below: 1) In the Introduction, at paragraph 2 the authors related frequency extrapulmonary infection, however, suggest a reference more actual. 2) The text structure is correct, however observer reference citation is not order. As 5th paragraph at Discussion section and number reference 19 in the last paragraph of the results. 3) Negative results were related for acid-fast bacilli smears and cultures, although molecular methods will may applied due to present a high sensibility to detect M. tuberculosis, which validated your results.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 11408

Title: Total Hip Arthroplasty for Surgical Management of Advanced Tuberculous Hip Arthritis – A Case Report

Reviewer code: 02976990

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-05-20 21:28

Date reviewed: 2014-07-17 23:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

General Comments The case report by Tan and Chin is well done and highlights an important operative technique that makes a big difference in patients with extrapulmonary tuberculosis with skeletal involvement, specifically hip involvement. One thing that stands out about this case, are the extremely good postoperative outcomes on the patient e.g. no more right hip pain and back pain, normal gait with no significant limb length discrepancy. Extrapulmonary TB has been shown to be on the rise. Treatment procedures that would address the disease and its complications are of great importance in improving outcomes (QALYs (Quality adjusted life years) and DALYs (Disability adjusted life years)). The paper is well written using proper English with good sentence structure. Revisions to be made on this paper are very minor and are generally around the discussion. I feel that the authors have included a lot of detail in the discussion section that should fall under the title "Case report". The details of the procedures done on the patient should be in the case report section while the authors should dwell on relating their procedures and findings to existing literature and work that has been done on patients with similar presentation. In paragraph 2, 4 and 6, the authors have related their procedure to existing literature. The rest appears to be a detailed description of the procedure they conducted which should feature under the case report section. Specific comments? It would be useful to clarify to readers how the diagnosis of TB was arrived at for this patient, that is, if the authors can access this information. Alternatively they can include a statement on the possible



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

differential diagnoses that were considered. I understand this might be difficult considering that the diagnosis was made many years ago. ? Two typing errors noted: o On page 7 the second last line reads “ (2) complete curettage an debridement” I believe this should be “(2) complete curettage and debridement”. Kindly rectify this. o On page 11, paragraph 2 there is a sentence that reads “ A large, 32-mm diameter head ws used” I believe this should be “A large, 32-mm diameter head was used”. Kindly rectify this.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 11408

Title: Total Hip Arthroplasty for Surgical Management of Advanced Tuberculous Hip Arthritis – A Case Report

Reviewer code: 00506525

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-05-20 21:28

Date reviewed: 2014-06-24 09:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. Authors should mentioned as excluded an active TB reactivation of joint infection. 2. Reference No. 18 is incomplete. 3. If possible, update references 2012-2014.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 11408

Title: Total Hip Arthroplasty for Surgical Management of Advanced Tuberculous Hip Arthritis – A Case Report

Reviewer code: 02908828

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-05-20 21:28

Date reviewed: 2014-06-24 22:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

World Journal of Orthopedics Title: "Total Hip Arthroplasty for Surgical Management of Advanced Tuberculous Hip Arthritis – A Case Report" June 24, 2014 The authors present a case in which they performed total hip arthroplasty in a patient with a previous surgery for TB-related hip arthritis. The patient initially presented with an indolent course of low-grade hip pain and symptoms of arthritis. The authors should give more documentation and description of the TB arthritis course. As far as I can tell, the TB arthritis and arthrodesis occurred more than 29 years before the patient presented with the current complaints. How was the TB arthritis diagnosed? Did the patient complete a course of TB therapy at the time? The current diagnostic tests were negative for TB and the CRP was normal, so it is unclear that the current episode is related to reactivation of TB. The authors should detail what evidence they have for reactivation TB hip arthritis. Without recovery of the organism in samples, the 'infected tissue' seen at the time of surgery could be related to any number of infectious causes. The fact that the patient was not restarted on anti-TB therapy suggests that the authors feel this patient's course was not related to 'advanced TB hip arthritis.' Without further details, it is uncertain that this patient's course was related to 'advanced TB hip arthritis', as the title suggests. Otherwise, the article is well written, aside from a few spelling errors, and would be of interest to the orthopedic surgery community.